P-ISSN: 2204-1990; E-ISSN: 1323-6903 DOI: 10.47750/cibg.2021.27.02.092

### Designing a Model for the Strategic Development of Human Resources in Nationwide Judiciaries Using Fuzzy TOPSIS Approach

### ELAHEH HASHEMZEHI <sup>1</sup>, MALIKEH BEHESHTIFAR <sup>2\*</sup>, MOHAMMADAMIN NIKPOUR <sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>PhD Student, Department of Public Management, Rafsanjan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Rafsanjan, Iran <sup>2</sup>Associate Professor, Department of Management, Rafsanjan Branch, Islamic Azad University, Rafsanjan, Iran <sup>3</sup>Assistant Professor, Department of Management, Kerman Branch, Islamic Azad University, Kerman, Iran \*Corresponding Author Email:M.beheshtifar@yahoo.com

Abstract: The present study was an attempt to design a model for the strategic enhancement of human resources in judiciaries across the country using fuzzy TOPSIS approach. The present research is applied in terms of purpose and exploratory in terms of approach. The Cochran's formula for limited sample populations was used to select samples from the statistical population. Based on this formula, the number of samples was determined as 365 participants and sample members were selected through multi-stage cluster sampling. The results of content analysis indicated that the model of strategic enhancement of human resources in nationwide judiciaries is comprised mainly of ninety-eight concepts, eighteen categories and six dimensions. The results demonstrated that the most significant inhibitors are "resistance of organizations to change", "lack of institutionalization of knowledge concerning management culture in the subsets", "inappropriate long-term policy for human resources", "inadequate support for managers", "reduction in motivational factors among employees", "weak support from senior managers", "absence of a proper context for monitoring, refining and training employees", and "inaccurate definition and improper implementation of support mechanisms". The results further demonstrated that the most important motivating factors are "explaining the role and position of each employee in advancing the goals of the group", "creating a context for employee self-control and self-management", "creating a spirit of cooperation and teamwork" and "establishing a logical relationship with performance results".

Keywords: Model, Strategic Enhancement of Human Resources, Judiciary, fuzzy TOPSIS

### INTRODUCTION

Managers of present organizations believe that employees are the most crucial source of competitive advantage for the organization. They contend that efficient human resources are of great importance on account of their scarcity and irreplaceability. Hence, organizations strive to maintain skilled human capital and develop their commitment (Weech, 2018: 34). People who are more committed to the values and goals of the organization may participate in the organization and enjoy their membership, which in turn increases the performance and productivity of that organization. Due to constant changes and transformations encountered by organizations, the issue of commitment and loyalty of human resources and performing the assigned roles as much as possible has been regarded as a matter of concern to managers. Hence, applying the appropriate strategy for human resources can ensure emotional commitment and increase organizational productivity and performance (Donate, Peña and Sanchez, 2016: 945). Human resources (HR) strategies will focus on the specific goals, actions and changes required in the organization. The issue that these strategies will address is the assurance that the organization has the required staff. Training, motivation, offering rewards, flexibility, teamwork and stable employee relationships are the conditions that guarantee the successful achievement of goals through company strategies (Guest, 2017: 10).

The core of human resource strategy is to maximize the talent and ability of employees. These strategic issues are all interconnected, thereby realizing organizational strategies. The purpose of human resource strategies is to provide guidelines for the development and implementation of programs and, furthermore, to provide the means to realize the organization's goals concerning how the human resources ought to be managed. These strategies enable the organization to measure progress and evaluate the results according to the objectives (Alfes, Shantz, Truss & Soane, 2018: 341). Knowing that the Judicature as one of the three independent branches of the state is

Copyright © The Author(s) 2021. Published by *Society of Business and management*. This is an Open Access Article distributed under the CC BY license. (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

responsible for the administration of justice and has been established to support individual and social rights, improving human resource strategies in the judiciaries throughout the country is one of the necessities that must be fulfilled, because there are challenges in improving the human resources strategy in Iran's judiciaries compared to other countries (Deghati, Mohammadi and Yaghoubi, 2017: 166). Lack of strategic and long-term attitude towards HR management in Iran's judiciaries would have negative effects on the proper planning of input processes, and the maintenance and the output of employees in the organization. This would also reduce productivity and effectiveness and leads to failure in fulfilling the mission of the organization (Eskandari and Jahanian, 2017: 60).

Moreover, due to changing and present conditions, the lack of strategic enhancement of human resource management in the judiciary has a direct impact on factors such as the recruitment process, HR needs assessment, HR planning, performance appraisal, maintenance of workforce, continuous attrition, internal and external organizational training, staff loyalty, organizational culture and behavior, and managers' relationship with employees (Rezaei, 2017: 12). In the field of HR supply, due to the lack of necessary permits to employ human resources, the judiciaries are facing a severe paucity of labor due to changes. On the other hand, the lack of a strategic plan for the scientific assessment of HR needs in the judiciaries, the human resources have been accumulated in unnecessary sections while lack of human resources is felt in other sections. Evaluation of work force performance is also ineffective due to the use of invalid evaluation forms as the placement of files is the only action taken with regard to the results of evaluations in the judiciaries (Barari, 2018: 121).

Since efficient HR is of paramount importance in the judiciary due to scarcity, irreplaceability, and the problems caused by many shortcomings in human resources strategies in the judiciaries throughout the country. Therefore, it shall be worthwhile to pay more attention to the preparation and implementation of strategic plans in the judiciary specifically in the field of strategic management and HR improvement. As organizations address organizational challenges and prioritize continuous improvement, there is a greater need for employee support, commitment and engagement. Thus, the present study is an effort to design a model for strategic enhancement of human resources in nationwide judiciaries and the following ancillary objectives are pursued:

- Prioritizing the inhibitors (i.e. hindering factors) in the strategic enhancement of human resources in judiciaries across the country
- Prioritizing the driving factors in the strategic enhancement of human resources in judiciaries across the country

### LITERATURE REVIEW

Bigdeli et al. (2018) conducted a study entitled "identifying the dimensions and components of human resource enhancement in education in providing a conceptual model." The results suggested that the status of HR enhancement programs has a relatively satisfactory level in moral, socio-cultural and individual dimensions of enhancement. However, the organizational, professional and educational dimensions were below average. The final model was designed in four parts: philosophy and goals, dimensions and components, administrative process and model output. Dehghanan and Yazdani (2017) conducted a study entitled "Strategic Enhancement of Human Resources in the Shipping Company of the Islamic Republic of Iran: "Application of Data-Based Theory".

The findings and results of the present study were divided into underlying factors, influencing factors, mechanisms and outcomes of strategic human resource enhancement. In their view, it is necessary to move from a process-oriented and administrative approach to a strategic approach in the strategic enhancement of human resources. Arman et al. (2016) conducted a study entitled "Designing a Strategic Model for Human Resources Enhancement in the National Iranian Oil Company". In their paper, the authors sought to design, present and test a model for strategic HR enhancement in the National Iranian Oil Company while examining the concepts of HR enhancement. For this purpose, several models in the field of strategic coordination and human resource improvement were reviewed and finally the basic theoretical framework of the research was created. The results showed that employees with coordinated combinations of different strategies have better performances compared to other combinations.

Christensen, Hughes and Rog (2019) conducted a study entitled "Strategic Human Resource Enhancement from an Employee Perspective: Initial Improvement and Providing a Measuring Index". This research has been measured with a 12-point index that has a positive relationship with employee enhancement, organizational learning culture, manager support for improvement and psychological environment. The results indicated the existence of potential communications between employees, the perceived coordination of strategic human resources between employees and the existence of a learning culture among employees. In his research, Professor Lee (2019) proposed a functional framework for the implementation of strategic HR enhancement, entitled "the Strategic Model of Human Resource Enhancement using Samsung's diagnostic system". The aim of this study was to improve the diagnostic system to reach the level of maturity concerning the strategic enhancement of human resources within the business environment of Korean organizations. Broadly, in this system, people working in the field of HR enhancement can take action to find a solution and improve human resources as a strategic business partner. Liang and Gong (2017) conducted a study entitled "Investing in Human Resource Enhancement in Chinese Private Companies: Strategic Option and Institutional Perspectives". In this study, based on a national survey of Chinese private companies, the findings indicated that strategic selection variables (e.g., education and training private entrepreneurs) have a positive relationship with HR investment. Government support for private business boosts the positive relationship between the variables of strategic option and HR investment.

### THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

### The concept of human resource improvement

One of the main responsibilities and processes in the cycles of human resources is improving human resources. Improving human resources focuses on creating a dynamic organization and opportunities for employees to learn and be educated to improve organizational, group and individual performance. Human resource improvement activities include designing and presenting education and training and effective organizational improvement (Tabarsa, Haj Karimi and Ganjali, 2016: 205). To provide a relatively comprehensive definition, human resource improvement can be defined as the process of improving and stimulating human expertise through organizational improvement, employees' education and training and performance improvement. In another definition, human resource improvement is a short-term or a long-term process or activity aimed at improving job satisfaction, productivity knowledge and expertise at different levels, namely individual, team, organizational or national levels (Sayyadi and Mohammadi, 2013: 50). As the new definition of human resource improvement, individuals in an organization must be equipped with qualities that do not interfere with the organization in any way and with all scientific insight, commitment and empathy, they should put all their energy, abilities, expertise and thoughts to make sure the organizational missions are realized and they must constantly produce new intellectual and qualitative values (Jahaniyan and Kazemi, 2017: 138). In general, human resource improvement has the following components (Vazifeh, Mehdi and Mohedifar, 2017: 125):

- Promoting scientific awareness and knowledge of the employees
  Promoting balanced and scientific behaviors in employees
- Promoting balanced and scientific behaviors in employees
  Creating added value as a quality in employees
- Creating added value as a quality in emp
  Dremeting added value as a quality in emp
- Promoting employees' capabilities
- $\checkmark$  Improving employees' skills in doing their job
- ✓ Updating employees' information
- $\checkmark$  The ability to solve problems in a scientific way
- ✓ Doing the job correctly
- ✓ Rational decision making
- ✓ Coordinated personality growth in employees
- $\checkmark$  The ability to mix and combine information and building new complexes

### The philosophy of strategic improvement of human resources

Human resource improvement must play an important role in the successful achievement of the goals of organizations and investments that are advantages for all the organizational beneficiaries. Human resource improvement plans and programs must be cohesive and coordinated with human resource and business strategies and support them. Human resource improvement must always be connected to performance and be designed to improve task, organizational, team and individual performance and in addition, it plays a main role in increasing productivity (Markoulli, Lee, Byington & Felps, 2017: 390).

Any individual in an organization must be encouraged to learn and they must be provided with enough opportunity to promote their knowledge and skills to maximize their qualifications and abilities. Individual learning frameworks must be presented by individual improvement plans that are focused on self-directed learning and are supported by official education and guidance. Organizations need to provide proper learning facilities and opportunities, to invest in learning and improvement; however, the main objective of improvement is something that the individuals who receive guidance and support from their managers, especially members of the human resources unit are responsible for (Yadav, 2019: 1320).

### Implementation of human resource improvement

The main elements of human resource improvement are:

- Learning: based on the definition provided by Nour Chams & García-Blandón (2019), learning is based on a relative change in behavior which results from their performance or experience (Nour Chams & García-Blandón, 2019: 120).
- Practical education: systematic and planned moderation of behaviors through instructions, plans and incidents of learning that enable an individual to acquire the necessary skills, knowledge and qualifications which are essential to do things effectively (Quan, Shi, Niu, Liu & Zhang, 2018: 171).

- Improvement: enhancing an individual's potential skills and abilities and turning them into actual skills and abilities by providing opportunities for learning and experiencing education.
- Theoretical education: improving knowledge and values and having a good understanding of all aspects of life, not just knowledge and skills that are only associated with special performance areas (Rubel, Rimi, Yusliza, & Kee, 2018: 320).

Following the above principles, the following questions are posed:

The main research question:

• What is the model of strategic human resources enhancement in the judiciaries across the country?

#### Ancillary research questions:

- What is the ranking of the driving factors identified in designing the model of strategic human resource enhancement in nationwide judiciaries?
- What is the ranking of the inhibitors (i.e. hindering factors) identified in designing the model of strategic human resource enhancement in nationwide judiciaries?

#### **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

In the present study, the mixed-methods approach was used which is conducted at two stages. The first stage was performed qualitatively by the method of content analysis. At the second stage, analytical survey was used. In other words, the interview and resource review were used during the first stage according to the initial goal, which is to design a domestic content model in the field of strategic HR enhancement in judiciaries across the country based on the content analysis approach. Thus, after conducting the interviews and observations and collecting qualitative data, thematic coding was applied to analyze the elicited data. In this strategy, the aim is to extract the concepts contained in textual data such as interviews by segmenting, classifying, summarizing and reconstructing them with an inductive approach. As for the quantitative stage, fuzzy TOPSIS was used to rank the driving and inhibiting factors.

The statistical population of this study falls into two categories. In the qualitative category, all judiciaries covered in the subject area of the research were studied through observation. Moreover, judicial experts with a history of service in the judiciary for over 5 years and those with managerial knowledge and experience in relevant positions were also included. In the quantitative part of the research, the statistical population is also comprised of all experts from the judiciaries. To select these experts, the method of snowball sampling was used to select a number of people from the statistical population for interviews.

In the quantitative part of the statistical population, Cochran's formula was used to select samples for limited sample populations, based on which the number of samples was determined as 365 people. Sample members were selected based on multi-stage cluster sampling. In this way, seven provinces were first selected randomly among the provinces of the country and then by referring to these provinces, all experts in the field of administration and finance were considered as sample members. The selected provinces included Tehran, Khorasan Razavi, Markazi, Kerman, Semnan and Yazd.

In order to collect information in this research, the review of documents and interviews were first used due to its qualitative and quantitative method. Thus, in the initial review of the available documents and books, work experience and theoretical foundations were reviewed so that the interviewer could gain a profound knowledge of the research topic as various factors were evaluated. Through the next stages, after answering the objectives of the research, in-depth interviews were conducted with the statistical samples of the research that were empirically involved in this matter. In the quantitative stage, the information was collected using a researchermade questionnaire based on the extractive model.

In the qualitative part, several methods including interviews and document analysis were used to collect information. In this study, because content analysis was used in data analysis, semi-structured interviews were conducted with the members of the statistical sample. Thus, at the beginning of the interview, a general explanation of the research and its objectives was provided to the interviewee and then the interview began. In the quantitative stage, a researcher-made questionnaire was used based on the results of qualitative research. Since the present study uses the ethnographic method, the validity and reliability proposed by Lincoln and Guba have been observed in the process of data collection through interviews. In this research, all the cases regarding the validity of the research were conducted through long-term presence in the results obtained data, collecting and maintaining raw data and referring to them after the review of the results in the assessment of the interpretations. In this manner, the opinions of three experts from the university and three other participants were extracted and their feedbacks were elicited. A researcher-made questionnaire was used at the quantitative stage. This questionnaire was used on a multiple-choice Likert scale based on the results of qualitative research. During the interview, all the comments of the interviewees were recorded and their comments were converted

into texts along with the researcher's observations and perceptions. After reaching the saturation point in the comments provided by the interviewees, the initial data were inserted into ATLAS.ti and the initial codes were

created with the help of this software. Then, based on the initial codes of concepts, the categories and dimensions of the model were extracted. Inhibitory and driving factors were also ranked using fuzzy TOPSIS and Excel.

### **RESEARCH FINDINGS**

# Results of the driving factors ranking in the strategic enhancement of human resources in the judiciaries across the country using the TOPSIS technique:

The options raised by the research question can be ranked in descending order. Any option with a larger numerical weight is more favorable. The results of Table 2 showed that "explaining the role and position of each employee in advancing the goals of the group" is ranked first with a numerical weight of "0.01979", "creating the context for the self-control and self-management of employees" with a weight of "0.019766" is placed in the second rank, "creating a spirit of cooperation and teamwork" is in the rank of "three" with a weight of "0.019765", "creating a logical connection between the results of performance with empowerment programs" is placed in the rank of "four" with a weight of 0.019741, "paying attention and respecting the employees' personalities as individuals to achieve organizational goals" is placed in the rank of five with a weight of 0.019716, "existence of energetic young force " is ranked six with a weight of 0.019716, "Definition of the goals and strategies of the organization" is placed in the rank of" seven" with a weight of "0.019715, "the managerial capacities of managers" is ranked eight with a weight of "0.019692, "participation of employees in all fields of work" with a weight of "0.019691" is in the rank of "nine", "creating the context for the continuous training and acquiring new skills by providing learning opportunities" is in the rank of "ten" with a numerical weight of 0.01969, "Organizational support for employees" with the weight of "0.019667" is in the rank of "eleven", "adoption of appropriate methods for evaluating performance" is ranked "twelve" with the weight of "0.019667", "personal characteristics of employees" with a weight of "0.019641" is placed in the rank of "thirteen", "law on wage equalization" with a weight of "0.019619" is in the rank of "fourteen", "team work experience" with a weight of "0.019595" in the rank of "fifteen", "the growing trend of transparency in the country" with a weight of "0.019594" in the rank of "sixteen", "the existence of a significant number of graduate specialists" with a weight of "0.019551" in the rank of "seventeen", "proportion of the field of study with the job of employees" with a weight of 0.019524 in the rank of eighteen. "constructive interaction with other organizations and institutions" with a weight of "0.019495" in the rank of nineteen, "formation of the Employee Financial Support Fund " with a weight of 0.019476 in the rank of " twenty and "holding festivals to identify and encourage elite forces" is ranked "twenty-first" with a weight of 0.019427 among the factors driving the strategic enhancement of human resources in the judiciaries across the country.

Table 2: Ranking the driving factors in the strategic enhancement of human resources in the judiciaries across the country				
Ran	Weigh			
k	t			
	0.0197	Existence of energetic young workforce		
6	16	Existence of energetic young workforce		
_	0.0197	Definition of goals and strategies of the organization		

0	10	
7	0.0197 15	Definition of goals and strategies of the organization
1	0.0197 9	Explaining the role and position of each employee in advancing the goals of the organization
9	0.0196 91	Employee participation in all areas of work
3	0.0197 65	Creating a spirit of cooperation and teamwork
12	0.0196 67	Adopting appropriate evaluation and performance methods
4	0.0197 41	Establishing a logical relationship between performance results and empowerment programs
5	0.0197 16	Paying attention and respecting the personality of employees as individuals who work to achieve the goals of the organization
10	0.0196 9	Creating the ground for continuous training and acquiring new skills by providing learning opportunities
2	0.0197 66	Creating a context for employee self-control and self-management
13	0.0196 41	Individual characteristics of employees

8	0.0196 92	Managerial capacities of managers
11	0.0196 67	Organizational support of employees
18	0.0195 24	The appropriacy of the field of study and the job of the staff
15	0.0195 95	Teamwork experience
17	0.0195 51	Existence of a significant number of specialized graduate workforce
21	0.0194 27	Holding festivals to identify and encourage elite forces
20	0.0194 76	Establishment of an employee financial support fund
16	0.0195 94	The growing trend of transparency in the country
19	0.0194 95	Constructive interaction with other organizations and institutions
14	0.0196 19	Law on the equalization of salaries

# Results of inhibitors (i.e. hindering factors) ranking in the strategic enhancement of human resources in nationwide judiciaries

The results of Table 3 showed that "the organizational resistance to change" with a weight of "0.019761" is in the first rank, while the other items are placed in the following ranks as follows: "lack of institutionalization of knowledge about management culture in the organization" with a weight of "0.019729" in the rank of "two", "lack of appropriate long-term policy for human resources" with a weight of "0.019727" in the rank of "three", "insufficient support from managers" with a weight of "0.019688" in the rank of "four", "reduction in motivational factors in employees" with a weight of "0.019681" in the rank of "five", "weak support from senior managers" with a weight of "0.019659" in the rank of "six", "absence of a suitable context for monitoring, refining and training employees" with a weight of "0.019658" in the rank of "seven", "lack of precise definition and appropriate implementation and support mechanism "with a weight of 0.019658 in the rank of "eight", "close attention to staff in provincial capitals for programs in the field of human resources " with a weight of 0.019658 in the rank of nine, lack of attention to the dimensions of teamwork in the utilization of human resources and its development" with the weight of 0.019656 in the rank of "ten", "reduction in motivation and creating an atmosphere of insecurity with inappropriate competitiveness" with a weight of 0.019653 in the rank of eleven, "inadequate use of potential in departments related to the field of human resources" with the weight of 0.019636 in the rank of twelve, "inadequate information and circulation of information" with a weight of "0.019627" in the rank of "thirteen", "Lack of conditions and enthusiasm among employees" with a weight of "0.01961" in the rank of "fourteen", "insufficient knowledge of the situation" with the weight of "0.019588" in the rank of "fifteen", "failure to observe active management participation in programs" with the weight of "0.019587" in the rank of "sixteen", "negative management attitude towards the freedom of action of employees" with the weight of "0.019582" in the rank of "seventeen", "lack of performance appraisal management to evaluate and improve programs" with the weight of "0.019569" in the rank of "eighteen", "weak organizational culture" with the weight of "0.019565" in the rank of "nineteen", "Lack of accurate and purposeful executive plan to identify talented employees" with a weight of "0.019563" in the rank of "twenty", "failure to evaluate specific performance and receive the necessary feedbacks" with the weight of "0.019562" in the rank of "twenty-one", "addressing the problems without employee participation" with the weight of "0.019561" in the rank of "twenty-two", "involvement with current affairs" with the weight of 0.019532 in the rank of "twenty-three", "failure to define the exact mechanism of law enforcement" with the weight of "0.019531" in the rank of" twenty-four ", "lack of a quick and easy process to perform staff-related affairs" with the weight of "0.019512" in the rank of "twenty-five", "weak legal protections" with a weight of "0.01951" in the rank of "twenty-six", "Inefficiency of the ruling education system in education and the Ministry of Science" with the weight of "0.019493 "in the rank of "twenty-seven", "incorrect understanding of existing technologies" with a weight of" 0.01949 "in the rank of twenty-eight, "Imposition of job duties" with the weight of" 0.019487 "in the rank of" twenty-nine", "lack of self-confidence among employees" with a weight of 0.019485 in the rank of thirty, "improper use of graduates from related fields" with a weight of 0.019463 in the rank of thirty-one, "negative mentality based on hindrance among employees" with the weight of "0.01946" in the rank of "thirtytwo", "inaccurate definition and implementation of the necessary mechanism to provide services and facilities to employees" with a weight of "0.019456" in the rank of "thirty-three", "ambiguity in the implementation of civil

service laws" with a weight of "0.019456" in the rank of "thirty-four", "lack of support to continue the education of employees" with a weight of "0.019451" in the rank of "thirty-five", "development of fear of change" with a weight of "0.019436" in the rank of "thirty-six", "lack of proper and constructive communication between divisions" with a weight of "0.019422" in the rank of "thirty-seven", "communicative network among employees" with a weight of "0.019407" in the rank of "thirty-nine", "lack of proper information about programs" with a weight of "0.01939" in the rank of "thirty-nine", "weak group participation" with a weight of "0.019335" in the rank of "thirty-nine", "weak group participation" with a weight of "0.019364". In the rank of "forty" and "insufficient financial resources" with a weight of "0.019335" in the rank of "thirty-nine" in the rank of "thirty-one". The above items are among the factors hindering the strategic enhancement of human resources in the judiciaries across the country.

Table 3: Ranking inhibitors in the strategic enhancement of human resources in judiciaries across						
the country						
Don						

Ran	*** * * *	
k	Weight	
	0.0197	
1	61	The organization's resistance to change
26	0.0194	
36	36	Developing a feeling of fear of change
17	0.0195	
17	82	Negative managerial attitude towards the freedom of action for employees
10	0.0195	
19	65	Weak organizational culture
4	0.0196	
4	88	Inadequate support from managers
22	0.0195	
22	61	Addressing issues without employee involvement
20	0.0194	Imposing ich dution
29	87 0.0195	Imposing job duties
16	0.0195 87	Inactive management participation in programs
16	0.0195	Inactive management participation in programs
15	0.0193 88	Insufficient knowledge of the situation
15	0.0195	
18	0.0193 69	Lack of performance appraisal management to evaluate and modify programs
10	0.0196	Lack of performance appraisar management to evaluate and mouny programs
6	59	Weak support from senior managers
0	0.0194	
28	9	Lack of proper understanding of existing technologies
20	0.0194	
30	85	Lack of employees' self-confidence
50	0.0193	
40	64	Weak group participation
10	0.0193	
41	35	Inadequate financial resources
	0.0195	
26	1	Weak legal protections
	0.0197	
3	27	Lack of appropriate and long-term policy for human resources
	0.0196	
9	58	Specific attention to staff in provincial centers for HR programs
	0.0196	Inadequate attention to the dimensions of teamwork in the use of human resources and its
10	56	development
	0.0194	
27	93	Inefficiency of the dominant educational system in education and the Ministry of Science
	0.0194	
31	63	Lack of proper use of graduates from related fields
	0.0194	
37	22	Lack of proper and constructive communication between divisions
35	0.0194	Lack of necessary support in order for employees to continue their education

#### 51 0.0196 8 58 Lack of precise definition and proper implementation of support mechanisms 0.0195 23 32 Involvement with current affairs 0.0193 39 9 Lack of proper information about the programs 0.0196 14 Lack of conditions and enthusiasm among employees 1 0.0194 32 Negative mentality based on hindrances among employees 6 0.0195 20 63 Lack of accurate and purposeful executive plans to identify talented employees Inaccurate definition and implementation of the necessary mechanism to provide services and 0.0194 33 56 facilities to employees 0.0196 5 81 Reduction in motivational factors in employees 0.0195 25 Lack of quick and easy process to perform administrative steps related to employees 12 0.0196 Lack of a suitable platform for monitoring, refining and training employees 7 58 0.0194 38 07 Communicative network among employees 0.0196 12 Improper use of the potential of departments related to the field of human resources 36 0.0194 34 56 Ambiguity in the implementation of civil service laws 0.0195 24 Lack of definition for the exact mechanism of law enforcement 31 0.0196

### Elaheh Hashemzehi et al/ Designing a Model for the Strategic Development of Human Resources in Nationwide Judiciaries Using Fuzzy TOPSIS Approach

### DISCUSSION The answer to the main question: What is the model of strategic human resource enhancement in

Improper information and information flow

competitiveness

### nationwide judiciaries?

13

11

21

2

27

53

62 0.0197

29

0.0196

0.0195

The results of content analysis showed that the model of strategic enhancement of human resources in judiciaries across the country includes ninety-eight concepts, eighteen categories and six dimensions.

Lack of institutionalization of knowledge management culture in the collection

Failure to evaluate specific performance and receive necessary feedback

Reduction in motivation and creating an atmosphere of insecurity and inappropriate

The first dimension is called strategic training and includes these categories: 1-empowerment of education (including the concepts of educational needs assessment, scholarship award, emphasis on e-learning, support for staff members with university education, the use of staff experiences for training, emphasis on staff training in departments with a large number of clients, creating dynamic contents for education, conducting internships and apprenticeships in and out of the country), 2- Increased and rapid action in human resources (i.e. encouragement and management support, teaching self-awareness and self-control skills, teaching the skills of empathy, training in problem-solving abilities, training in the field of vision, mission and organizational goals in employees), 3-Continuous development of training (including the concepts of training based on job needs in organizational issues, focusing on shortages in staff skills, conducting training on the effectiveness of education, sharing information among the staff, the recruitment of capable instructors, quality assessment for training courses).

The second dimension is called strategic performance management and includes the following categories: 1-Execution and evaluation (including the concepts of clarifying expectations, achievable goals, creating a believable and credible measurement system, and shortening the reward time) 2- Decision-making system for human performance outcomes (including the concepts of setting job standards in each department, setting

statistical standards in each department, fact-based decision-making, result-oriented performance) and 3-Designing a performance-based payment system (including the concepts of monitoring and enforcing laws and regulations, providing the necessary funding, evaluation of the effectiveness of training programs, and succession programs, evaluation of staff skills, evaluation of knowledge-sharing and the status of information technology).

The third dimension is promoting organizational culture which includes these categories: 1- Adaptation (including the concepts of salary harmonization and reduction in access processes for managers) 2- Emphasis on work ethics (including the concepts of information transparency, transparency in verdicts, information distribution between employees, acceptance of diversity concerning opposing views and opinions, starting think tanks, creating a teamwork environment), 3- Decentralization (including the concepts of entrusting affairs to the private sector, implementing delegations, calculating the cost of outsourcing processes, involving low-level managers in important meetings), 4- Coordination (including the concepts of holding training courses in the field of organizational values, providing a good image of employees through cultural and educational activities, staff promotion based on ethical standards, the recruitment of staff based on ethical standards, developing standards and social values and the evaluation of the implementation of ethical standards).

The fourth dimension is called career development which includes the following categories: 1- Creating successors (including the concepts of identifying the skills required for each position, establishing an appointment committee, the promotion based on the approval of the appointment committee, spreading information about vacancies, and promotion based on specialization), 2 - Work force retention (includes the concepts of holding empathy-enhancing meetings between managers and employees, preventing unnecessary job changes, equal opportunities for promotion, transparency about staff promotion, eliminating discrimination against employees, and promoting the employees' sense of belonging regarding the jobs).

The fifth dimension is the strategic reward management which includes these categories: 1- Reward and motivation system (including the concepts of identifying capable employees for adjudication training, creating a system for identifying and prioritizing the needs of employees, creating job incentives, promotion, seasonal incentives), 2- Support (including the concepts of free counseling and psychotherapy for employees, medical grants, scholarships, support for staff ideas, providing welfare facilities), 3 -Work independence (including the concepts of providing the necessary training to perform various tasks, the placement of training in the workplace, educational planning, paying attention to the competencies of employees, determining the tasks of interest to employees, improving the spirit of inquiry, the exchange of skills between managers with employees).

The sixth dimension is strategic communication which includes these categories 1- Effective communicative network among employees (including the concepts of family reunification for employees, holding staff camps, improving networks and informal communication, eliminating the top-down view, promoting solidary between employees, and continuous communication with managers), 2- Re-engineering processes to speed up communication (including the concepts of identifying steps that need to change each process, piloting a new process, evaluating employee and client satisfaction with new processes), 3-Implementing IT for more effective communication (including the concepts of identifying new technologies related to work processes, teaching the benefits of technology, providing existing infrastructures, providing rewards for people who use technology, paying attention to the technological skills of individuals during the recruitment and the technological skills of people at appointment).

### The answer to the first and second ancillary questions:

## What is the ranking of the driving factors identified in designing the model of strategic enhancement of human resources in judiciaries across the country?

### What is the ranking of the inhibiting factors identified in designing the model of strategic enhancement of human resources in the judiciaries across the country?

The ranking results showed that the most important motivating factors include "explaining the role and position of each employee in advancing the goals of the group", "creating a context for employee self-control and self-management", "creating a spirit of cooperation and teamwork" and "establishing a logical relationship between performance outcomes and empowerment plans".

### CONCLUSION

The most basic responsibility of traditional managers was to constantly assess the employees and threaten to fire them in case of any inefficiency. Traditionally, human resources were considered as equals to raw materials and machinery. In modern management, human resource management is strategy-based, and each strategy has a plan and purpose. In addition, performance standards are developed justly, mental traits of the employees are important and human resource management focuses on factors such as connections, cooperation and respect for others, education, support and creating unions. The main goal of human resource improvement is economical and social growth in the organizations. In order for the process of strategic improvement of human resources to

be effective, many policies are adopted in the organizations to achieve the desirable result. Human resource improvement is quite significant when it comes to developing the national economy of a country as well. Developing and utilizing technology requires improvement of scientific expertise and knowledge and this improvement is made by holding intensive educational courses on specialization, application of technology, various models for engineering new technical skills and processes. In most developing organizations, strategic improvement of human resources leads to cost-saving, enhanced quality of services, products and productivity. Many books, articles and researches have been published in the field of strategic improvement of human resources. Although nowadays the strategic improvement of human resources is a concept that goes beyond occupational education and preparing the personnel to accept more responsibilities; but the transformation process of an organization requires strategies that take improvement of the competitors as well as organization's beneficiaries into consideration and predicts the knowledge and skills that are necessary for the future. In the studies conducted by other researchers, Mondes (2019), strategies such as visual methods, behavioral modeling, finding problems, job rotation, written training, lecturing and speeches, skills and consistent education have been introduced as the most important strategic improvement of human resources. In the study conducted by Chang (2005), it was concluded that if human resource is strategically improved in the respect of organizational goals, organizational performance would be improved. Nyget (2015), in a study, presented a model based on an emphasis on the formation of an organizational substrate that would attract talented individuals and leaders to itself and involves all members of the organization in the model. In addition to the strategic development model, human resource is related to occupational changes and transformations and it mixes a set of employees' skills and long-term plans and strategies and in this way guarantees the effective and efficient utilization of resources. In a study, Adamerio (2013) has expressed the importance of indexes such as employees' participation in customer rights, organizational commitment and employees' qualification, and considered qualification to be more essential than other indexes when it comes to the strategic development of human resources. Mitsakis (2017) has presented a model in their study using environment-friendly indexes for the strategic development of human resources. Based on this study, the mentioned mode is capable of adapting to the changeable business environments. In this model, economical crises were introduced as the inhibitory factors. Mitsakis (2015) conducted a study and presented a model for the strategic development of human resources and based on this study, the inhibitory factors included lack of attention to the interests of beneficiaries and stakeholders. Driving factors included managers' awareness, existing knowledge, cultural and industrial maturity. Gravan (2010) has introduced organization's responsiveness, sustainability and professional morality of managers, profitability and organizational success as the driving factors of the strategic development of human resources. Simio (2010) presented a model based on reinforcement of creativity, knowledge and skills. In this research, lack of a tool for evaluating the strategic development model of human resources was introduced as the inhibitory factor. Based on the study conducted by Han (2013), consistent environmental changes and mixing organizations and lack of attention to modern technologies are inhibitory factors of the strategic development model of human resources. Finally, it is recommended to utilize the model presented in this study for strategically developing human resources in the judicatories around the country.

### REFERENCES

- 1. Alfes, K., Shantz, A. D., Truss, C., & Soane, E. C. (2018). The link between perceived human resource management practices, engagement and employee behaviour: a moderated mediation model. The international journal of human resource management, 24(2), 330-351.
- 2. Arman, M., Hosseini, S. E. Tangestani, A. (2016). The effect of social capital and human resource maturity on sustainable management of human resources (Case study: Active companies in the petrochemical industry). Social Capital Management, 1 (3), 113-138.
- 3. Bigdeli, M., Davoodi, R., Kamali, N., & Fermani, Gh. A. (2018). Identifying the dimensions and components of human resource improvement in education to provide a conceptual model. Journal of Human Resource Management Research, 10 (2), 100-173.
- 4. Christensen Hughes, J., & Rog, E. (2019). Talent management: A strategy for improving employee recruitment, retention and engagement within hospitality organizations. International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 20(7), 743-757.
- 5. Deghati, A. (2016). Strategic approach to retaining human resources in higher education in South Khorasan province. Public Management Research, 32 (9), 137-154.
- 6. Dehghanan, H., & Yazdani, H. (2017). Strategic Development of Human Resources in the Shipping Company of the Islamic Republic of Iran: Application of Data-Based Theory. New Research in Management and Accounting, 13 (3), 121-148.
- Donate, M. J., Peña, I., & Sanchez de Pablo, J. D. (2016). HRM practices for human and social capital development: effects on innovation capabilities. The International Journal of Human Resource Management, 27(9), 928-953.

- 8. Eskandari, A., & Jahanian, R. (2017). Dimensions and components of faculty members' improvement in higher education institutions. New Research in Humanities, 37 (0), 55-65.
- 9. Ghodsi, A., Barandoost, R., & Naderiheshi, Kh. (2017). The Impact of Strategic Human Resource Planning on the Development of Working Teams (Case Study: Al-Zahra University). New Research in Management and Accounting, 33 (0), 15-42.
- 10. Guest, D. E. (2017). Human resource management and performance: still searching for some answers. Human resource management journal, 21(1), 3-13.
- 11. Irum, A., & Yadav, R. S. (2019). Human resource information systems: a strategic contribution to HRM. Strategic Direction, 10(1), 50-51.
- 12. Jahanian, R., & Kazemi, S. (2017). The impact of competence-oriented human resource management on performance efficiency. Studies in Psychology and Educational Sciences, 23 (3), 123-147.
- 13. Lee, H. W., Pak, J., Kim, S., & Li, L.-Z. (2019). Effects of human resource management systems on employee proactivity and group innovation. Journal of management, 45(2), 819-846.
- 14. Liang, J., & Gong, Y. (2017). Human resource development investment in Chinese private firms: Strategic choice and institutional perspectives. Management and Organization Review, 13(1), 57-83.
- 15. Markoulli, M. P., Lee, C. I., Byington, E., & Felps, W. A. (2017). Mapping Human Resource Management: Reviewing the field and charting future directions. Human Resource Management Review, 27(3), 367-396.
- Nour Chams., & García-Blandón, J. (2019). On the importance of sustainable human resource management for the adoption of sustainable development goals. Resources, Conservation and Recycling, 141(5), 109-122.
- 17. Quan, P., Shi, Y., Niu, L., Liu, Y., & Zhang, T. (2018). Automatic Chinese Multiple-Choice Question Generation for Human Resource Performance Appraisal. Procedia computer science, 139, 165-172.
- 18. Rezaei, Mir Ghaed, A., Seyed Naghavi, M., Dehghanan, H., & Amiri, M. (2017). Investigating and determining the efficient functions of human resources based on the architectural model of human resources. Productivity Management, 40 (10), 185-220.
- Rubel, M. R. B., Rimi, N. N., Yusliza, M. Y., & Kee, D. M. H. (2018). High commitment human resource management practices and employee service behaviour: Trust in management as mediator. IIMB Management Review, 30(4), 316-329.
- 20. Sayadi, S., and Mohammadi, M. (2013). Theoretical approach to human resource strategy. Researcher, 13 (6), 46-55.
- 21. Sheybat Al-Ahmadi, S. A. & Aghahadi, S. (2017). Investigating the role of strategic human resource planning in educational quality. Educational Management Research, 31 (8), 63-82.
- 22. Tabarsa, Gh., Hajkarimi, A., & Ganjali, A. (2016). Designing a model for coordinating human resource management strategy and business strategy. Strategic Management Thought, 2 (1), 189-212.
- 23. Vazifeh, Z., Mehdi, M., & Movahedifar, H. (2017). Investigating the role of human resource management and knowledge management on the productivity of education staff in Zahedan. Management and Entrepreneurship Studies, 20 (3), 114-127.
- Weech-Maldonado, R., Dreachslin, J. L., Epane, J. P., Gail, J., Gupta, S., & Wainio, J. A. (2018). Hospital cultural competency as a systematic organizational intervention: Key findings from the national center for healthcare leadership diversity demonstration project. Health Care Manage Rev, 43(1), 30-41. doi:10.1097/HMR.00000000000128.