

Management for Non Civil Servant Human Resources in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli, Indonesia

Johannes Sembiring¹, Saiful Batubara², Nurmala³, Selamat Ginting⁴, Bunga Br Sembiring⁵

^{1,3,4,5}*Insitut Kesehatan Deli Husada, Deli Tua, North Sumatra*

²*Universitas Islam Sumatera Utara, Indonesia*

Abstract

The General Hospital of South Tapanuli (RSUD-KTS) is the only hospital in the Regency. Since its establishment in 1998, South Tapanuli Regency Hospital, there has been a shortage of health workers with civil servants' status, it recruited the non-civil servant workers. There are three categories of non-civil servants who work in the hospital, namely; (1) Freelance Daily Workers, (2) Contract Doctors, and (3) Voluntary Workers. Freelance Daily Worker recruitment is based on South Tapanuli Regency's Regulation No. 98 of 2017, thus for Contract Doctor and Voluntary Worker purely hospital management policies. Freelance Daily Worker Position is a policy after enacting Law No. 5 of 2014 concerning civil servants and previously the issuance of PP No. 49 of 2018 about the Management of PPPK (previous policy of non-civil servant). The freelance daily worker policy is a compromise policy of the South Tapanuli Regent for the continuity of position and the earning of the workers who have served before the policy. At the same time, the hospital can also continue to operate well in their presence. However, in this case, the non-civil servant workers are not included as PPPK because PPPK workers are hired based on National selection, and those who have hired possess a NIPPPK number. Contract Doctor's existence is a general hospital business policy carried out in hospitals with BLUD status (internal policy), applied in the South Tapanuli Regency Hospital even though it is not a BLUD and the research shows a positive contribution to the hospital. The voluntary worker policy needs to be reviewed because hiring health workers without salary and the potential will cause related problems; law, employment and professional ethics.

Key Words: *Hospital Management; human resources; freelance daily workers, Non-Civil Servant Workers, South Tapanuli.*

1. INTRODUCTION

The intention of the government and parliament to exclude non-civil servant employees in 2021 as a follow up to the Republic of Indonesia Law Number 5 Year on State Civil Apparatuses (ASN) and Indonesia Government Regulation Number 49 of 2018 has made the issue commonly discussed because it directly related to the issue of the status of the existence

and utilization of Non Civil Servants employees in the government environment, especially the local government (Sendhikasari, 2020).

With decentralization and regional autonomy since 1999, it has given broad authority to regional governments to organize their regional development and manage resources, including management of employees within their government environment. Article 2 paragraph 1 of Law Number 43 of 1999, the authorized official may appoint temporary employees. What is meant by non-permanent employees are non-civil servant employees who are appointed within a certain period to carry out governmental and developmental duties? And what is meant by officials in this law is the Personnel Development Officer (PPK). PPK for the provincial government is the governor, and for the city, the district is the Regency or city mayor.

Based on Minister of Administrative and Bureaucracy Reform (Menpan-RB) Regulation No. 26/2011 concerning Guidelines for Calculating the Number of Needs and Regulation of the Head of State Staffing Agency (BKN) No. 19/2011 concerning General Guidelines for Formulating Civil Servants' Needs. Referring to the regulation, South Tapanuli Regency (KTS) is one of the governments that lack civil servants in running their government functions, especially in the education sector and health workers for Community Health Center (Puskesmas) and hospitals. Besides, KTS is not included in the regions where the budget for employee expenditure needs is above 60% of the APBD (Local Government Budget). The value of employee expenditure in 2016 is only 44% of the APBD. In its development, it is known that KTS does not experience inequality in employee expenditure under public expenditure, which is below 50 per cent, meaning that adding employees to cover the shortage of human resources is possible (Wiryanto, 2017).

The Regional General Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency (RSUD-KTS) was established in 1998 in Sipirok, the only one Public Hospital in South Tapanuli Regency until now. From its establishment until now in 2020, Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency still lacks human resources with civil servants' status. To fulfil human resource needs, recruitment of non-civil servant employees is mainly for medical personnel. Based on data from the Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency in 2020, the number of human resources with Non civil servant status, there are 181 people this number is 69% of the total HR. If it is associated with the discourse of the elimination of Nov Civil Servant Paramedics conditions of dependency on Nov Civil Servant Paramedics RSUD-KTS for operational, the potential will cause problems.

The problems in this research are formulated as follows; (1) How is the existence of Nov Civil Servant Paramedics in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency, (2) How is the policy related to Nov Civil Servant Paramedics in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency, and (3) How are the effectiveness and problem of policies related to Nov Civil Servant Paramedics in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency based on Law Number 5 of 2014 About State Civil Apparatus (ASN).

RSUD-KTS, located at Jalan Rumah Sakit No. 1 Sipirok, is a development of the Sipirok Community Health Center. Founded on May 28, 1998, on + 3.8 hectares of land with Decree of South Tapanuli Regent No.07 / Pr / 2008. At present, KTS Regional Hospital has 125 beds and the classification of Type C Hospital and has been nationally accredited in 2018. As the only hospital in KTS, patients who visit are from KTS residents and North Tapanuli Regency residents, whose sub-district borders directly with Sipirok district.

2. METHOD

A survey method or construct in-depth interviews with research subjects, observations at the research site were applied. Analysis of related documents and literature provided a clear picture of Nov Civil Servant Paramedics (Civil Servants) policies in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency based on Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning civil servants in following the predetermined problem formulation.

Data analysis in qualitative research was carried out when the data collection took place until the completion of the study. Data processing and analysis use descriptive analysis to identify the Nov Civil Servants policies at the hospital level, regency and national governments, their implementation and implications. Activities in analyzing qualitative data refer to Miles and Huberman (2008), namely (1) data reduction, (2) data presentation, (3) drawing conclusions. All stages always pay attention to aspects of data validity that generally apply in qualitative research.

3. RESULT

Public Hospital of South Tapanuli is located at Jalan Rumah Sakit No. 1 Sipirok, is a development of the Sipirok Community Health Center. Founded on May 28, 1998, on + 3.8 hectares of land with Decree of South Tapanuli Regent No.07 / Pr / 2008. At present, KTS Regional Hospital has 125 beds and the classification of Type C Hospital and has been nationally accredited in 2018. As the only hospital in KTS, patients who visit are from KTS residents and North Tapanuli Regency residents, whose sub-district borders directly with Sipirok district.

The services available at Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency consist of general practitioners, dental services, 12 specialist services for outpatient and inpatient care, labour, surgery, medical rehabilitation, supporting laboratory and radiology diagnostics, and pharmacy services. Some specialist services are not open every day because they use specialist doctors who are not permanent hospital employees but contract doctors who work part-time on certain days.

Even though Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency is Type C, with the number of specialist services included quite complete, the hospital's overall performance is not as expected. Based on 2019 patient visit data, hospital patients treated very low for outpatient services with a BOR (Bed Occupancy Ratio) of less than 40.00. The above data was also clearly seen during field observations where the hospital atmosphere was relatively quiet, and

there was no general activity at the same hospital. Data obtained indicated an adverse and contradictory finding. The number of doctors is quite a lot, but another medical staff status of Nov Civil Servant Paramedics(Civil Servant Workers) are found hundreds; in contrast, the number of hospital patients is relatively low and without a significant increase.

This hospital is under the ownership of the South Tapanuli Government, which operates as a regional Technical Implementation Unit (UPT) per Presidential Regulation No. 77 of 2015 concerning Hospital Organization Guidelines, intending to provide public health services whose management is based on the delegation of authority. Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency is led by a Head of UPT under and is responsible to the Regent of KTS through the Regional Health Service.

Related to his duties, the Head of the Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency is responsible for the duties and functions of the hospital as stated in law NO 44/ 2009 concerning Hospitals article 1 that, "Hospitals are health care institutions that conduct individual health services in a complete manner that provide inpatient services, outpatient care, and emergency department", and KTS Regulation No. 17 of 2010 concerning Retribution, "South Tapanuli Regency Regional General Hospital provides health and nursing services to patients including outpatient, inpatient care and provide practice or research land for students and students". Furthermore, matters relating to governance include the organizational structure framework explicitly stated in the Decree of the Regent of South Tapanuli No. 13 of 2017 Concerning Governance Patterns of Class C Hospital in KTS.

Since the establishment of Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency in 1998 as a regional government hospital, the Ministry of Health's Regulation No. 159b / Menkes / Per / II / 1988 regarding the Hospital and Minister of Health's Decree No. 228 / Menkes / Per / III / 2002 concerning Guidelines for Preparation of Minimum Service Standards that Regions Must implement. There are not many problems related to the physical development of hospitals and various hospital equipment, including the procurement of diagnostic tools (clinical laboratories and radiology units including CT-Scan), hemodialysis and emergency facilities (Emergency Room, ICU and NICU / PICU) due to the support of KTS regional budget and North Sumatra Province budget as well.

The physical development of relatively fast hospitals is inversely proportional to human resources' development, moving very slowly. From its establishment in 1998 until now, Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency is still constrained by a shortage of medical personnel in all areas of expertise according to national standards except midwives who far exceed the needs. Meeting the needs of human resources with civil servants' status is very unpredictable because the allocation of regional ASN selection revenue every year is minimal for the health sector. At the same time, the shortage of workers is far more significant. In January 2020, the number of civil servants in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency only 30.3% of the total human resources, amounting to 260 people. This condition can be illustrated from ASN acceptance information as stated in Announcement No. 810/6941/2019 concerning the Needs of Civil Servants in the KTS Government Environment for Fiscal Year 2019 dated November

8, 2019, which states that 129 formations were opened for the health sector as many as 16 formations. This formation is intended for Puskesmas (Community Health Center) and a Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency.

Based on the current area of expertise, the number of human resources at the Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency in January 2020, there is a less balanced proportion because some areas of expertise are lacking, and some fields are very excessive. A list of expertise can be seen in Table 1 below:

Table 1. List of Human Resources at South Tapanuli Regency Hospital Based on Expertise in January 2020

No	Expertise	Civil Servants	Non Civil Servants	Total
1	General practitioners	7	14	21
2	Specialist Doctor	5	8	13
3	Dentist	2	-	2
4	Nurse	32	48	80
5	Midwife	7	77	84
6	Pharmacist	1	-	1
7	Assistant of Pharmacist	2	1	3
8	Public Health	4	2	6
9	Nutritionist	3	1	4
10	Physiotherapist	1	1	2
11	Radiographer	3	1	4
12	Lab Analyst	2	4	6
13	Medical Record	1	2	3
14	Non-Medical	10	21	31
Total		80	180	280

Table 1 shows the strength of staff with the competence of midwives and general practitioners. Simultaneously, the number of pharmacists and medical therapies is insufficient, and the number of nurses is right per national hospital HR standards.

The effort taken to provide sufficient human resources at Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency is to accept civil servants, who currently are the majority of employees employed. PNS consists of 3 (three) categories, namely; (1) Temporary Daily Employees (THL), Contract Doctors (DK) and Voluntary Workers (TKS). THL is an employee recruited by the South Tapanuli District Head Regulation (Perbup TS) No. 98 of 2017 concerning the Procedures for Appointment and Termination of THL in the District Government of the Regency is updated with TS No. PERBUP 45 of 2019 concerning the Second Amendment to Perbup TS No. 98 of 2017 concerning Procedures for the Appointment and Dismissal of Freelance Daily Workers in the District of TS Regency. The contracted doctor was recruited

based on the cooperation agreement between Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency and the doctor in person who had received approval from the Health Service and Regional Personnel Agency of KTS. At the same time, TKS is an employee who is accepted to work voluntarily by the Head of UPT Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency at the person's request.

Table 2. Personnel Status at Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency by January 2020

No	Status of Personnel	Number	%
1	Civil Servant (PNS)	80	30,3
2	Freelance Daily Worker (THL)	92	34,4
3	Contract Doctor	22	8,5
4	Voluntary Worker	67	25,8
	Total	260	100

Table 2 shows that the dependence of Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency on Nov Civil Servant Paramedics currently in charge of providing services is significant. From the information obtained in the field that for structural hospital positions are generally supported by civil servants, the number of active civil servant human resources directly providing medical services is less than the existing number.

Of the three categories of Civil Servants in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency, only THL is the official policy of the District Government of KTS because its existence is regulated through Perbup (Regent Authority). The KTS regional budget bears the TS and salary, and the amount refers to the District Wages of KTS. Doctors Contracts for general practitioners and specialists are a form of a cooperation agreement that is commonly done in hospitals with the Regional Public Service Agency (BLUD). However, Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency is not a BLUD; this collaboration pattern was adopted to attract doctors to join the service. Salaries or incentives do not refer to civil servant payroll but are determined based on agreement and approved by the Health Office and BKD. Whereas the naming of TKS is purely the RSU leadership policy, and there is no Regency policy. KTS related to TKS and also not recorded in the Health Service and KTS Employment Agency. There is no obligation to provide salary or incentives from the hospitals of Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency to the TKS, and this is stated in the SK Receipt of the TKS. The Decision of Appointment to become Nov Civil Servant Paramedics from the three categories above is signed by the Head of UPT Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency for a 1 (one) year work period. Volunteers may be extended for the following year after evaluating each employee's performance at the end of the year.

For the Civil Servants, besides doctors, becoming a THL in KTS Regional Hospital is exciting. Besides being a civil servant, the interest of university graduates in health becomes THL. One of the most often obtained reasons during interviews is the difficulty of getting a job in the appropriate field because, in KTS, there are no other hospitals. THL income in the

form of salary and other income from medical service distribution is considered quite feasible. It refers to the regional salary standard accompanied by benefits and other rights that are not much different from civil servants, such as leave, official travel costs and competency development. From April 2020 data, from 101 THL employees issued Decree SK stipulation as THL 2020 from current Head of Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency, there is more than 90% is an extension as THL. From interviews and documentary studies obtained during the study, several people from THL had previously been sentenced as K-2 (another personnel status) and TKS, so that they had served more than ten years continuously. Some ex-TKS workers who were then appointed as THL even for the early generation before 2005 had been appointed as civil servants in 2007 through the honorary appointment line under Government Regulation No. 48/2005.

4. DISCUSSIONS

Human Resources is the most critical element in an organization or institution's life, especially those engaged in community service such as hospitals. It is different from general government services in the Regency Government. TS, whose service hours are set only during official business hours from 08.00 a.m. - 4.00 p.m Western Indonesia Time, hospital services are non-stop 24-hour service without a day off. According to the characteristics of the work and services provided, hospitals require more human resources in the number and field of medical and non-medical expertise.

As a non-BLUD government-owned hospital that should work in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency is a civil servant in a certain amount and expertise that has been required by Minister of Health Regulation No 30 of 2019 concerning Hospital Classification and Licensing, updated with Regulation No. 3 of 2020 About Classification and Hospital licensing that applies nationally. Concerning the hospital HR standards above the KTS Regional Hospital, there is a lack of staff with civil servants' status because there are only 80 civil servants as of January 2020 and not all areas of expertise are available.

The policy adopted about personnel shortages in KTS accepts THL as Nov Civil Servant Paramedics who work in government agencies, including those serving in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency. The existence of Nov Civil Servant Paramedics in the hospital has been going on since its establishment in 1998. THL in the district government environment. TS is regulated through Perbup. No. 98 of 2017. THL acceptance policy is mainly to accommodate Nov Civil Servant Paramedics employees who previously existed before RI Law No. 5 of 2014 and additions as needed. The Nov Civil Servant Paramedics welcomed this policy because it was considered a temporary solution to the sustainability of their work and income as medical personnel in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency. Data revealed from the referee of an interview with one of the THL who has served more than ten years as follows "... in my opinion this policy is very suitable for us I got a decree as THL and in salary according to a regional standard of salary and we can work calmly "this is also strengthened by the statement of a K-2 status personnel employee who in 2020 was transferred to THL; " THL rules are more certain, including the salary that suits UMK

because there are regulations from the Regent, and now I am happy with my new status as THL .. "

The ideal goal of the THL policy for the district government. KTS is explicitly mentioned in the part weighing point an of Perbup No. 98 of 2017 to "provide services to the community so that it can run well, effectively and efficiently then it is deemed necessary to appoint a Freelance Daily within the Government of South Tapanuli Regency." "That is for the orderly administration of personnel and for the sake of legal certainty. It needs to be regulated further about the procedures for its implementation ". Data found that the two statements above clearly indicate the benefits of THL workers for the local government. With the Decree, there is a statement of certainty for the THL related to legal wetness, rights and obligations, social security system and recruitment for their work. As a public policy, Perbup KTS No. 98 of 2017 concerning THL, although the basis of its construction is intended to be able to give goodness and regularity to something that is set, in its implications, it still has positive and negative sides.

This policy's positive side is the accommodation of former honorary staff or TKS who have previously served at the KTS Regional Hospital to become THL. Perbup No. 98 TS of 2017 can be seen as a solution to PN PNS or honorary PN problems, which became a national issue until now. This statement is proven by the absence of demonstrations related to honorary employees' fate in KTS as in other regions. In this perspective, this policy can be seen as an anticipatory policy on the issue of honorary staff that arises after the promulgation of Law No. 14 of 2014 and the slow issuance of government regulation related to PPPK as a guide in PPPK management. Opening job opportunities for university graduates in the health sector is also a positive value amid the difficulty of competition to become a civil servant because of the small quota and the absence of private hospitals in KTS.

Another positive thing that directly touches the interests of the THL is the rules related to the duties, functions, rights, obligations, competency development and social service systems that refer to PNS standards except for payroll that refers to the value of minimum salary. The Pebkab TS is one of the regions that pay payroll to PNS based on shared values from the referral data. Only a small portion of the district/city level can provide a decent salary according to the government's minimum wage standard. This ability to pay is also supported by the KTS budget posture, which is considered very good. So far, the budget value for personnel expenditure has always been below 50%. In recent years, it has been below 50% of the regional budget. Until the end of the study, there was never any information in the form of late payment for any of the bullets or deductions from THL salaries outside the provisions.

The negative side of this policy is the granting of authority to the UPTT and SKPD to propose needs and names to be selected and accepted as THL by referring to the provisions stipulated in PERUB TS No. 98 of 2017 and other regulations related to this matter. This policy is often used as part of a political agenda and accommodation and compromises various pressures from parties who take unilateral interests. From a critical analysis, it found that the policy's implementation, along with the results of the policy itself. The data shows

that there has been an overload in the naming of some areas of medical expertise for specific fields, as mentioned above. Excessive acceptance for general practitioners and very much for midwifery experts indicate that the UPT General Hospital's proposal is not based on a careful analysis of human resource needs. Data makes confirmed by hospital officials who stated that the error had lasted a long time and was piled up and had never been appropriately corrected.

The existence of Nov Civil Servant Paramedics in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency is not a form of the Implementation of RI Law No. 14 of 2014 because in terms of recruitment and determination does not refer to PP RI No. 49 of 2018 About PPPK Management which states that the Process of Acceptance, Selection and Determination of Appointment of PPK is carried out nationally by BKN under the supervision of the Menpan-RB. So Nov Civil Servant Paramedics in THL, DK and TKS in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency are not PPPK as intended by law.

From the hospital management perspective, the Civil Servants existence is needed because the hospital does not have enough human resources to become a Type C hospital. However, the status or type of hospital is still maintained by recruiting human resources that are lacking with the policy of Perbup TS No. 98 of 2017 and internal policy of the hospital with the Board of Directors. The adequacy of human resources from the joining of PNS and Nov Civil Servants in KTS Regional Hospital can only meet the hospital's standards based on the rules alone. Still, it can not make the hospital with good performance. Data obtained is seen by the absence of collision between the adequacy of HR with the Number of Patients and BOR. The number of patients in 2016 and this figure tends to be static with BOR below 40% in sharp contrast to similar public and private hospitals where BOR continues to increase along with JKN-BPJS (National Health Insurance) starting in 2015. Acceptance of HR is not based on needs. The growth in the number of visits and BOR is a waste of the state budget and contradicts the initial goal of receiving non civil servants, especially THL, to administer effective and efficient government services.

As a state-owned hospital that has full support in the budget and policies needed, KTS Hospital should be able to take advantage of the policy in the form of Perbup TS No. 98 of 2017 and permission to take the policy of recruiting human resources in the form of professional work contracts with values based on the agreement to advance the hospital and show good performance until it deserves to be a BLUD. An in-depth analysis of the correlation between policies related to PNS and hospital performance in this study turns out the statement of Nugroho (2010) which states "misinterpretations of policies and policies in the community and officials"; the correct policy of the wrong implementation does not produce any results, and the wrong policy of correct implementation also has problems. Data shows that the objectives of a policy are very much determined by the officials who implement them. What happens in RSUD - KTS shows that excellent policies cannot achieve their objectives to increase effectiveness and efficiency in hospital performance, requiring significant corrections that prioritize rationality.

Voluntary , although it is based on the policy of the Head of KTS Regional Hospital on the request concerned, is not a public policy because it is not supported by the policy of the Staffing Officer in this case, the Regent of TS. The TKS acceptance policy stated that there was no salary, which was a hostile policy. It seemed to exploit professional human resources and potentially lead to legal, employment, and professional ethics problems.

5. CONCLUSIONS

Based on the results and discussion above, some conclusions can be drawn as follows:

1. The South Tapanuli Regent's policy regarding THL is an anticipative, accommodative and compromising policy on the existence of non-civil servant staff existing before and after the enactment of Law Number 5 of 2014 in the South Tapanuli Regency Government. Especially for those who served in Public Hospital of South Tapanuli Regency.
2. non-civil servant employees within the South Tapanuli Regency Government are not part of the PPPK as meant in Law Number 5 of 2014. Based on PP Number 49 of 2018, PPPK is selected, determined and appointed nationally. The State Personnel Agency issues a Master Number (NIPPPK).
3. The voluntary workers in the South Tapanuli Regency Hospital should be eliminated because of the potential for legal problems and other regulations related to employment and health professional ethics.

6. REFERENCES:

- [1] Government of Indonesia, 1999. Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 43 of 1999 concerning Civil Service Principles
- [2] Government of Indonesia, 2009. RI Law Number 44 of 2009 concerning Hospitals
- [3] Government of Indonesia, 2014. Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Servants
- [4] Government of Indonesia, 2005. RI Government Regulation Number 48 the Year 2005 concerning Appointment of Honorary Staff to Civil Servants
- [5] Government of Indonesia, 2018. Government Regulation Number 49 of 2018 concerning Management of Government Employees with Contract Agreements
- [6] Government of Indonesia, 2015. Presidential Regulation No. 77/2015 on Hospital Organization Guidelines
- [7] KemenPAN-RB, 2011. Guidelines for Calculating the Number of Requirements for Regional Civil Servants
- [8] Nugroho, H., 2017. Correct (Wrong?) Policy Implementation Wrong (Correct?), e-Journal, Subang University downloaded on June 20, 2020.
- [9] Sandhikasari, D., 2020. *Abolition of Honorary Staff and Its Impact*, Jakarta, Research Center for the Expertise Agency

- [10] South Tapanuli Regency Government: South Tapanuli Regent Regulation No. 98 of 2017 concerning Procedures for the Appointment and Dismissal of Independent Daily Workers in the South Tapanuli Regency Government
- [11] South Tapanuli Regency Government, 2017. Decree of the Regent of South Tapanuli No. 13 of 2017 concerning the Governance Pattern of Class C Regional General Hospitals in Tapanuli Regency
- [12] State Civil Service Agency, 2011. Head of BKN Regulation No. 19 of 2011 concerning General Guidelines for Preparation of Civil Servant Needs
- [13] Wiryanto, W., 2017. *Bureaucratic Reform through Redistribution of Civil Servants in the Field of Education and Health Services in South Tapanuli Regency*, the National Institute of Public Administration, was downloaded April 14, 2020.