
PERSPECTIVES OF INCLUSIVE EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN: CONTENT ANALYSIS

Saima Hanif¹

Ph.D. Scholar, Institute of Special Education, University of the Punjab, Lahore,
Pakistan.

Email: saimalhr21@gmail.com

Dr. Hina Fazil²

Assistant Professor, Institute of Special Education, University of the Punjab,
Lahore, Pakistan.

Email: hinafazil.dse@pu.edu.pk

Rabia Basri³

Ph.D. Scholar, Institute of Special Education, University of the Punjab, Lahore,
Pakistan.

Email: rabia.basri@ue.edu.pk

Ghulam Hussain⁴

M.Phil. Scholar, University of Management and Technology, Lahore,
Pakistan

Email: adadmnlhr@gmail.coms

Saira Hanif⁵

Ph.D. Scholar, Institute of Special Education, University of the Punjab, Lahore,
Pakistan.

Email: xaira.chudhary@gmail.com

Tabssum Naz⁶

Department of Management Sciences University of Okara

Email: maliktabssumnaz986@gmail.com

Abstract

The study aimed at reviewing the research studies in the field of inclusive education in Pakistan with the purpose to identify different themes related to inclusive education. For this purpose, the researchers reviewed 16 research studies in the field of inclusive education in Pakistan. The content of these studies was analyzed by using thematic analysis technique. In this sense, the study was qualitative in nature following content analysis technique. The purpose of this content analysis was to summarize the research work carried by researchers on inclusive education at

school level. To analyze the literature 16 researches were selected from national and international research journals during the period of 2010 to 2021. The findings of these researches were organized under six major themes and several subthemes. Traces of Inclusive Education in Pakistan, Inclusive Education in Pakistan: Facts and Practice, Impediments, Issues and Challenges, Strengths of Inclusive Education in Pakistan, Mitigation Spaces. The content analysis revealed that that in Pakistan inclusive education is an emerging trend and is gaining momentum but slowly. A lot of work and reforms has to evolve for implementation of the inclusive education in Pakistan.

Key words: *Inclusive Education, Pakistan, Research Studies, Content Analysis, Themes*

Introduction

Education is the most significant aspect in the social and economic development of any country. It produces informed and productive citizens, which helps to build human capital. Education gives marginalized and socioeconomically disadvantaged communities the chance to rise above poverty (Hussain K, 2012).

There are four major themes which pertain to the ever-evolving expedition towards inclusive education: 1 human rights-based approach, 2 responses to children with special needs, 3 reactions to marginalized groups, and 4th is altering educational systems. "Regions are still far from properly adopting the notion of inclusive education as altering the education system at large," they correctly contend, and a lot of countries continue to focus on special needs or other marginalized groups (Operti, Walker, & Zhang, 2014).

Educators and human rights activists became more aware of the accessibility and quality education accessible to special children during the first decade of the twenty-first century. In the subcontinent, right to education was less than 10% of school-aged special children (UNICEF, 2014).

The themes of teacher cooperation, a collaborative culture, affection, care, curiosity, and engagement of miniatures, as well as priorities of parents and the community as a whole, must all be identified. These topics go well beyond the current conceptions of inclusion, which are extremely narrow. On the other hand, an effort should be made to extend inclusivity to the sphere of democratic leadership. Leadership is not something that can be done by a sole person; it must be done by the entire institution's staff. According to various leadership roles, "inclusive education is very closely associated with disseminated leadership". A school located in rural location in Cyprus can also help with the division of tasks (Praisner, 2013).

Human rights is another perspective on inclusive education, and according to it, peer acceptance must be one of the fundamental meanings of schooling in order to promote self-esteem and a superior standard of living for person with disabilities. In United States there has been a lot of encouragement on inclusion. In addition, other OECD nations are articulating the benefits of inclusion in academia and also giving social benefits to students with impairments (Fisher, Roach & Frey, 2002).

Statement of the Problem

The purpose of this literature analysis was to summarize the reforms of inclusive education in Pakistan by national and international researchers from the period of 2010 to 2021. The intent of the current literature analysis was also to trace the prevailing situation, practices, perceptions of personals and emerging trends and issues of inclusive education in Pakistan.

Objectives of the study

Following were the main objectives of the study

1. To review the research studies in the field of inclusive education in Pakistan for the period 2010 to 2021.
2. To generate major themes about perspectives of inclusive education in Pakistan.

Research Design

The study was qualitative in nature following content analysis technique

Procedure of the study

With the purpose of content analysis in mind, the researchers sorted out the research studies in the field of inclusive education that was carried out during the period of 2010 to 2021 in Pakistan. These researches were published in renowned national and international research journals. In this literature analysis we only include the researches that had been conducted in school scenario and researches on higher education addressing inclusive education in Pakistan were excluded. To find the related articles/researches key terms like, inclusive education in Pakistan, practices, trends, and perception of inclusive education in Pakistan, were used.

The researchers located a number of researches related to key words but only those researches were included in analysis that was available and published online. These researches were using qualitative, quantitative and mix paradigm of research. Initially 50 researches, conducted by Pakistani authors, were drawn from different national and international journals and then these articles were scrutinized on the basis of the purpose of literature analysis. At the end fifteen researches were selected to carry the analysis. These researches were depicting the current situation, practices, trend, issues and benefits of inclusive education in Pakistan.

The results of selected articles were analyzed and organized under the themes of traces of inclusive education in Pakistan, facts and practices, impediments, issues and challenges strengths of inclusive education in Pakistan and mitigating spaces. These themes were further divided into subthemes on the basis of results and findings of the selected studies. The subjects/respondents of the selected researches were teachers, special need students and stakeholders who play a vital role in the success of inclusive education in any country. Following table elaborates the basic information about the research studies review in this study

Table: 1. *The research studies reviewed in the study*

Sr. No	Title of the Research	Authors	Year of Publication	Journal Name
1	Comparison between the perceptions of primary school teachers towards inclusive education in Peshawar, Pakistan	Ahmad, Reba, , &Ahmad	2020	<i>Journal of the Social Sciences</i>
2	Inclusive education in primary and secondary schools of Pakistan: Role of teachers	Madiha Ehsan	2018	<i>American Academic Scientific Research Journal for Engineering, Technology, and Sciences</i>
3	An Inclusive Schooling Model for the Prevention of Dropout in Primary Schools in Pakistan	Muhammad Shahid Farooq	2013	<i>Bulletin of Education and Research</i>

4	Attitude of secondary schools' principles & teachers toward inclusive education: Evidence from Karachi, Pakistan	Ghouri, A. M., Abrar, N., & Baloch, A	2010	<i>European Journal of social sciences</i>
5	Access to free and compulsory education: A case of children with special needs in the Subcontinent	Hameed, A., &Manzoor, A	2014	<i>Pakistan Journal of Special Education</i>
6	Similar Agenda, Diverse Strategies: A Review of Inclusive Education Reforms in the Subcontinent	Abdul Hameed and AfafManzoor	2019	<i>Bulletin of Education and Research</i>
7	Inclusive education in government primary schools: Teacher perceptions	Hashmi, S., Khan, I. K., &Khanum	2017	<i>Journal of Education and Educational Development</i>
8	Exploring teachers' experiences and practices in inclusive classrooms of model schools/Model	Muhammad Uzair-ul-HASSAN, Mushtaque HUSSAIN Iram PARVEEN Joiciane DE SOUZA	2015	<i>Journal of Theory and Practice in Education</i>

9	Inclusive Education at Primary Level: Reality or Phantasm.	Khan, I. K., & Behlol, M. G.	2014	<i>Journal of Education and Educational Development</i>
10	Attitude of Hearing Impaired Students towards Inclusive Education in Pakistan	Abid Masood Khan, Abdul Sami, Afsheen Salahuddin	2021	<i>Journal of Inclusive Education</i>
11	Study of attitudes of parents, teachers and managers towards inclusive education in Pakistan	Nusrat Tabassum, Dr. Almas Kiyani, Muhammad Asif Chuadhry, and Sumaira Kiyani	2014	<i>International Journal of Innovation and Applied Studies</i>
12	Pakistani and Australian Pre-Service Teachers' Attitudes and Self-Efficacy Towards Inclusive Education	Sadia Shaukat, Umesh Sharma and Brett Furlonger,	2013	<i>Journal of Behavioural Sciences</i>
13	Inclusive education in government primary schools: Teacher perceptions	Itfaq Khaliq Khan, Shujahat Haider Hashmi, Nabeela Khanum	2017	<i>Journal of Education and Educational Development</i>
14	Developing inclusive education approaches among stakeholders in Pakistan	Anjum Bano Kazimi, Syeda Wajiha Kazimi	2018	<i>Journal of Education and Social Sciences</i>

15	Attitude of teachers, administrators And policy makers towards inclusive Education	Latif Ahmed	2012	http://pr.hec.gov.pk/Thesis
16	Fostering Inclusive Education in Pakistan: Access and Quality in Primary Education through.	Khadim Hussain	2012	

Traces of Inclusive Education in Pakistan

The depiction of school reform in Pakistan regarding inclusive education is not very mature. The development of new segregated special schools and the renovation of existing segregated special schools were prioritized in the 1990s and early 2001s, with significant funding support from the Ministry of Special Education. All provinces have distinct policy ideas when it comes to the devolution of education at the provincial level. However, in order to meet the international commitment (2007), “Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities” (CRPD), government and private institutions have made various formal and informal initiatives. When it comes to education decentralization at the provincial level, each province has its own policy ideas. Government and private organizations, on the other hand, have taken a variety of formal and informal steps to satisfy this international commitment.

Rapid actions in the form of various pilot projects have been taken during the last five years. A pilot project of inclusive education, in two districts of South Punjab were launched by the “Punjab Government's Department of Special Education”, which were funding from the “Department for International Development” (DIFID). The project's major goal is to screen children with disabilities and enroll them in regular schools. Every school that participates in this project will receive 40000 PKR for capacity building, such as pathways and ramps. Teachers' professional development programs were also on the agenda to help mitigate the problems of teaching diverse learners in the classroom. Initiating inclusive learning at their schools has been a proactive move by the business sector.

The majority of school improvement planning is done by medical or psychiatric professionals, with standard teacher education playing a minor role. As a result, inclusive education is unable to break free from the confines of the "medical model". "Amin Maktib Model," is the most popular model with governmental endorsement where psychologist plays a

dominant role. One other renowned model school, "Rising Sun Model," is governed by a physician. Inclusive education will never achieve its actual potential with such type of leadership. Rural Inclusive Education Project (RIEP) has been launched by "Ghazali Education Trust Lahore", a renowned NGO in the meadow of education, in which isolated rural private schools are transformed into inclusive schools. The majority of school improvement planning is done by medical or psychiatric professionals, with standard teacher education playing a minor role. As a result, inclusive education is unable to break free from the confines of the "medical model." This endeavor is yielding greater results, and it is growing by the day. The private sector is also making efforts in other large cities, although as previously stated, there is still a long way to go in this direction (Hameed A &Manzoor A, 2019)

On the grounds of "National Plan of Action", first policy was formulated in 2006 that recommended the equal right of education in the form of "inclusive education" that is not feasible in the course of isolated systems somewhat it demands teamwork from other related treaty. "United Nation Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities" (UNCRPD) during 2011, was ratified by the Government of Pakistan. It was stated in the convention that "it is responsibility of the state to provide equitable inclusive education". Recently, a very vital legislation was approved by the government in the form of "Right to Free and Compulsory Education Act 2014". Article 25-A of the charter asserted that "State shall afford free and obligatory education to all children of the period of five to sixteen years" (Hameed, &Manzoor, 2019).

The only noteworthy official document for Persons with Disability in Pakistan is National Policy (2002) which provides a comprehensive framework regarding the schooling of special children by Pakistan government. This policy promotes inclusion but, fundamentally this was based on medical model (Hameed, &Manzoor, 2019).

In 2014, Government Special Education Department of the Punjab launched a pilot project, in a couple of districts of South Punjab with an enormous fund of 170 million to execute inclusive education. Recently, Declaration on Inclusive Education 2015" has been passed by University of Management and Technology Lahore, Pakistan in its first "International Conference on Inclusive Education" (ICIE). A significant investigation about education structure for special persons in Pakistan showed that "Pakistan has transformed from stationary notion of segregated educational institutions of special pupils towards a novel philosophy of inclusive education. Though, this new idea of inclusive education is limited to the inclusion of children with mild to moderate disabilities (Hameed, &Manzoor, 2019).

Inclusive Education in Pakistan: Facts and Practice

Perceptions of Prospective Teachers towards Inclusive Education

Prospective teachers of Pakistani had more effectual conduct regarding inclusion as compared to prospective teachers of Australia. Being an Islamic republican, Pakistan strongly acknowledges equal human rights of education with no inequity of disability. Islam gives value to people with disabilities and admitted that they have a noteworthy function in all aspects of society

as well as fiscal, social and national rights. It may be implicit that Pakistani prospective teachers have strong spiritual viewpoint to furnish the needs of special children. They demonstrate more efficacious conduct to squeeze the philosophy of inclusive education at school level (Shaukat S et al, 2013). Pakistani prospective teachers might have communal relationships with each other throughout their course work. They may have more explicit experiences of learning regarding inclusion of person with disabilities which enables them to promote their sagacity of efficacy to grip the diverse needs of children in inclusive institutions (Shaukat S et al, 2013).

Attitudes of Teachers towards Inclusive Education

The results indicated that greater part of teachers of inclusive institutions has optimistic approach about inclusive education. They were pleased in teaching PWDs. They believe that inclusive program is an enviable reform that may profit PWDs and society. Meanwhile they understand the notion of inclusive education and acknowledge schooling as the fundamental right of PWDs (Ghouri, Abrar & Baloch, 2010). Teachers know the significance of inclusive schooling. The study also revealed that teachers were ready and willing to allow PWDs in their schools but, they had a partial capability to tackle their unique educational needs (Khan et al, 2017).

Parent Attitudes towards Inclusive Education

Teachers reported a variety of evidences and cases of parents' support in a numerous ways which quickly changes both the students (with and without disabilities) because of inclusive programs. Positive parent collaboration is a vital and important facilitating parameter in achieving inclusive schooling. Parents are optimistically involved in their children's good performance in inclusive schools. They seemed satisfied as opposing to previous studies that were carried in regular schools (Hassan et al, 2015).

Attitudes of Heads

Nusrat Tabassum et al (2014) reported in their study, contented that heads of schools were adequately aware about the purpose of inclusive schooling. All heads were of opinion that students without disability and having disability is taught mutually. The heads were satisfied with the available resources and facilities to run inclusive education program. They expressed that inclusive education evoke socialization between both the groups. Two heads were not (67 percent) agreed that inclusive education can cause stress and anxiety in teachers. Two head teachers were agreed with the appropriateness of inclusive education and just one (33 percent) head teacher was satisfied with the suitability of instructional resources. All heads teachers were of opinion that all teachers need continuous professional development to address inclusive education and 67 percent head teachers were not willing to teach both of groups together. All the heads give their consent that students with disabilities were academically grooming in inclusive education. According to the head teachers, special students participated in co-curricular activities. They all disagreed that inclusive education affected the learning quality of students with disabilities and (67 percent) were of view point that students with disabilities suffered academically in inclusive education schools.

Role of principle is crucial for inclusive education. Principles showed anxiety about additional time for collaboration, co-teaching, communal scheduling time and other variables. These results show principles' self-ego of designation is a barrier to achieve shared collaboration. All respondents agreed for implementing the useful approach for inclusive education. Total of funding and funding for professional development for inclusive education nominated as obstacle. They have concerns about asst. principle, fund allocation time and school board support (Ghouri, Abrar & Baloch, 2010).

Attitudes of PWDs toward Inclusive Education

It was remarkable to recognize that most of the students with hearing impairment be of the same opinion that inclusive education will enhance their wellbeing and also will help them in the improvement of social and emotional development. The greater part of the hearing impaired students were strongly concurring about inclusive education will develop the strength of sportsmanship in them and will decrease the communication fissure between them and peers with normal hearing (Khan et al, 2021).

Concerns and Acceptance

A teacher plays a key character for introducing and imparting novel concepts to subsequent generations. In inclusive settings, a teacher must be more accountable and liable for appreciating all pupils in his/her class. A school cannot include pupils with physical, intellectual and students with minor disabilities. While sharing their experience regarding inclusive education they shared "they never felt they have made a mistake by enrolling SEN. They assist special students to enable them in adjusting themselves to classroom ethos". Moreover they added that "Special students who need extra help, have to teach in mainstream school". They must be provided the opportunity to experience new world because if they are not provided with that opportunity and kept them separate, it can cut them off from society (Hassan et al, 2015).

Impediments

Lack of Awareness

If we give awareness to public about accurate meaning, significance and implementation of inclusive education then the inclusion is possible. We have to raise awareness in order to promote inclusive education which can efficiently be furnished by conducting awareness enhancing seminars, workshops and sessions that focus the feature of inclusive education (Ehsan, 2018).

Many factors are contributing to affecting the development of inclusive education in a realm, some of them are limited consciousness about the disability, pessimistic attitudes towards persons with disabilities and communication fissure among different stakeholders are the major fences in implementing inclusive education (Khan et al, 2021).

Segregated Society

Segregation refers to "society has ignored people with disabilities". Teacher experienced those parents and other member of the family also ignored the special children. There are a lot of special children in our society. Society push person with disabilities in

a corner and make them isolated. They're supposed to be an inclusive society instead of segregated society (Hassan et al, 2015).

Advocacy of Inclusion

People are unaware about the enclosure of special children in inclusive schoolings since, there is an inadequate perception regarding the term advocacy. The stacks are supposed to be advocated that "special persons are not a curse for society".

Advocacy can be accepted in diverse manners i.e. through speaking forums and arguments at schools particularly on the subject of inclusion in perspective of Pakistan. Moreover, radio programs can also be broadcasted where teachers and pupils can express their views about this issue (Ehsan, 2018).

Financial barriers

One mammoth barrier in establishing inclusive schools is lack of funding. In Pakistan there were only a few institutions which were practicing inclusive education. But these a few institutions had not provided with proper facilities yet. In respect of inclusive education Pakistan is facing similar challenges just like other developing countries. In Pakistan model schools of inclusive education those were studied, suffering from shortage of facilities, services and equipments (Hassan et al, 2015).

In a study, the principals of the inclusive education school claimed that they required economical and financial sustain from the administrative department in order to modify institution ethos to promote learning of the students with unique needs. They argued that modifications were vital prerequisite for initiating inclusive education agenda. Inclusive schools require ramps, IT gadgets (AV aids, CCTVs, LVD setc), human resources, resource room, involvement of communities and parents (Behlol G M, 2011).

Service providing structure, financial assistance, multi-grade class rooms and teaching and crowded classrooms as well create strain for teachers to admit student with disabilities in classrooms (Hameed & Manzoor, 2019).

Teaching Methodology

In the context of Pakistan, schools are not practicing inclusive teaching methodology at present and neglecting the salient feature of inclusive schooling. By involving all the learners, in same class, in different activities without any discrimination regarding disability we can ensure initiation and execution of inclusive schooling in country. Furthermore, teachers do not have adequate and necessary teaching skills that enable them to include special students in their class rooms. In schoolrooms, group activities should be plane in such a way that make sure the contribution of all the students (with disabilities and without disabilities) (Ehsan, 2018).

Scarce of Resources

According to teachers insufficient and lack of instructional material is a major barrier in achieving inclusion. Schools have not provided with adequate instructional materials that are required to educate the students in inclusive set ups. Available classroom resources and

facilities are not upto the standards. Occasionally, equipment is incomplete. Sometimes shortage of teaching staff is problematic (Hassan et al, 2015).

Inaccessible Infrastructure

The literature reveals that lacking providing the accessibility framework in inclusive schools systems, it is unfeasible to launch an appropriate inclusive education program. The ethos of school must have relevance with the unique needs of special learners. The facilities of building, grounds and water coolers have to be easily reachable for entire learners who are learning in school. In addition, instructional strategies, procedures of assessment, and audio/visual equipments should be according to the requirements of the special learners. Continuous professional development of teachers is needed at permanent bases. Modifications in assessment procedures, teaching methodologies and content are crucial to suit requirements of the special need students (Behlol, 2011).

According to the research, provision of accessible framework is considered a crucial important aspect to facilitate learner in inclusive schools. Inclusion can only be achieved by the provision of appropriate infrastructure which allow special learners to enhance their accessibility in institutional environment. Accessibility can be furnished by the construction of ramps for physically handicapped students. In attempt to instruct visually impaired students training of the teachers in Braille codes and tactile development is necessary. Besides this, the children with speech and hearing impairments, it is compulsory to maximize their level of their, so that they become able to deal accordingly. Due to inaccessible infrastructure mobility is a very severe issue. Not only an accessible infrastructure is required but a trained, well qualified and professional staff is also required who support the learners in resolving accessibility issues (Ehsan , 2018).

Interconnected barriers

Teachers identified unavailability of proper supervision in pilot project schools is a big barrier (LS1). Even though teachers encourages inclusive schools but other barriers evenly present, like parents are not fiscally sound, they do not have positive thinking about their child; lack of confidence, insecurity, transportation, unavailability of teaching support, extended syllabus, shortage of time and facilities, deficiency of trained teaching staff and psychologists . Head teachers and teaching staff also were reluctant to let them get enrolled in the school as they believe they would be a threat to school results (Hassan et al, 2015).

Issues and Challenges

This literature analysis also pointed out that in inclusive schools teachers had more acceptances for students who have visual impairments and hearing impairments with mild to moderate level of disability. In contrast, teachers had fewer acceptances for inclusion of students who have severe disabilities. This means that teachers can fulfill the unique instructional needs of learners having mild to moderate impairments and find the management of learners with severe disabilities challenging.

It also requires cash to improve the school's infrastructure in order to adapt it to the needs of exceptional children. Students with impairments are also excluded when the curriculum is approached from a psychological standpoint. School is a place that promotes social balance, equity, and kindness, but psychological approaches focus on deviant population than normal population in order to build a rich environment (Behlol, 2011).

Although the fact that teachers admitted that CWDs experience bullying and hooting by other normal peers (Khan et al, 2018). To support instructors in the education of special needs pupils, parents must be fully involved (Behlol G M, 2011).

Despite the fact that teachers give CWDs extra time and treat them with respect, they are still unable to meet their educational demands due to a lack of capacity and instructional materials in schools(Khan et al, 2018).

Teachers do not receive regular professional development in order to satisfy the requirements of all students. Rules encourage inclusive schooling but CWDs are unable to access school infrastructure and facilities (Khan K I, 201).

Challenges for PWDs

Many youngsters with hearing impairments are unable to comprehend what their instructor and other students are saying. They do not ask the other students to repeat the things that the professors have taught in class (Khan et al, 2021).

Hearing-impaired students face numerous obstacles in their academics and social lives. In country's present societal situation, children even who have minor hearing impairment are academically at risk in comparison to their normal hearing peers (Khan et al, 2021).

According to Khadim Hussain, the following are several hurdles to inclusive education programs in Pakistan:

1. Negative views toward children with disabilities among parents, teachers, politicians, service providers, and community members;
2. A lack of parental knowledge of the potential of children with impairments;
3. Accessibility of school buildings, schoolrooms, grounds, toilets, and transportation;
4. Disparities in the present curriculum, procedures of assessment, and existing examination system;
5. Insufficient financial support;
6. Lack of support system, deficient trained and well qualified professionals, unavailability of medical and paramedical staff;
7. Absence of follow-up and supervision of activities;
8. All stakeholders are required to share their experiences and offer support for the execution of inclusive education in true spirit.
9. Unavailability of data regarding the prognosis of disability

Strengths of Inclusive Education in Pakistan

It encourages disabled pupils to participate in educational activities. Inclusion improves the educational accomplishment of students with disabilities while having no effect on non-disabled students' learning. Many people believe that students with significant disabilities can benefit from inclusive education (Ahmed, 2012).

Impact on student performance

It is undeniable that children with disabilities may learn better in an inclusive setting, which is beneficial not only to children with disabilities but also to regular students. They believed that children with disabilities had no negative impact on the learning environment (Ahmad, Reba, & Ahmad, 2020).

All children benefit from inclusive education, and children with disabilities should be educated in conventional schools so that they can learn more in an inclusive atmosphere (Ahmed, 2012).

The majority of teachers at inclusive schools believe that inclusive education has a constructive impact on students' performance and is useful to them. This type of environment has a good reflection on performance of learners. In such situations, children can learn a lot from one another. Furthermore, normal learners enhanced as they began to assist special pupils, which allowed them to increase their knowledge. When special learners are integrated in regular schools, they do not obstruct the improvement of other normal peers; contrarily, they learn from one another (Hassan et al, 2015).

Ensure Equality

Inclusive education promotes equity, raises disability awareness among those without disabilities, and improves societal acceptance of people with disabilities. In an inclusive context, students learn social adjustment. Inclusion helps kids with impairments avoid being labeled and, as a result, contributes to social inclusion. In an inclusive setting, students with impairments are not overlooked (Ahmed, 2012).

Impact on Student Personality

Inclusive education fosters a well-balanced personality, a favorable attitude toward school, a healthy sense of self and positive behavior. It does not cause problems with communication between students and teachers. In terms of learning speed, kids with disabilities can keep up with those without disabilities. Students with and without impairments do not experience frustration or discomfort as a result of inclusive education (Ahmed, 2012).

Student involvement

Teachers who are working in inclusive classrooms believe that participation of student is outstanding and they gain knowledge from one another. It demonstrates distinction between the experiences of instructors who observe inclusive schooling from outer surface and those who work at model schools. Nonetheless, because the learning rates of children with and without impairments vary, teachers believe that inclusive education has a variant change on performance of students. It does not imply that kids with disabilities are less capable; rather, it indicates that there is a variation in learning rate between the two groups of pupils (Hassan et al, 2015).

Economical

Inclusionary education is a low-cost strategy that could be applied in Pakistan.

The education of pupils with disabilities is the responsibility of regular classroom teachers, who have qualms about implementing inclusive education (Ahmed, 2012).

Mitigation Spaces

Policy and legislation

Because heads and instructors are constantly replaced, the inclusive education process has delayed. It lacks policy because frequent transfers have resulted in a shortage of experienced teachers in these schools, affecting children's learning. Some inclusive school teachers believe that Pakistani policy on inclusive education has to change. They also stated their opinion that recent educational policy measures have been very beneficial and inspiring (Hassan et al, 2015).

According to a survey of the literature, the inclusive education movement was primarily developed and concentrated by national and international INGOs, like UNESCO, UNICEF, and NGOs along the country. There has been no major evolution in policy formation for the inclusive schooling yet. At the moment, both special and regular schools are isolating working (Hameed &Manzoor, 2014).

Social awareness

Someone who is socially conscious is aware of the social constructions and cultures that surround them. It is necessary to raise awareness among stakeholders and other members of society. "We launched an awareness campaign and visited numerous families to educate them towards inclusion," explains a teacher. "Awareness in society is really important," a teacher at an inclusive school once said, "and it may be obtained through media or any other means." A child should have the right to attend a local school that accepts all children and meets all of their needs." "Nothing goes regularly in Pakistan," an inclusive school teacher observed. This can be good, in my opinion, if attitudes and behaviors are modified. Seminars should be organized for awareness of students' and attendance of these seminars should be mandatory for all students" (Hassan et al, 2015).

Involvement of community

Schools are the only places which can successfully cater the needs and priorities of both the community and the individuals who make up that society. Inclusive schooling encourages society to take an active role in the education of their children by supporting the school. In Pakistan, the community is generally not interested in school. By instilling a sense of responsibility in the community, inclusive schooling brings the community into the classroom. When the local community believes that the school is theirs, they will furnish the fundamental needs and requirements on their own terms. Many issues will be handled as a result of community input. It is the community that will ensure that no child is left behind in school. Schools that attend to the needs of their students are successful (Farooq, 2013).

School Ethos

Inclusive education will remain a pipe daydream unless schools are made accessible to all students, including those having impairments. Without the provision of educational opportunities, supports and services to all children, school may be prove a dumping groundS (Hassan et al, 2015).

Technical support

Technical support refers to the provision of machinery and technical equipment, as well as technical personnel who use the equipment in the classroom for the benefit of students and learning. The majority of inclusive school teachers believe that technical assistance should be offered for inclusive classrooms. "There should be a psychologist who recognizes difficulties and informs teachers," a teacher believes. "A medical examination is also required. Furthermore, a psychologist should monitor such exceptional youngsters in order to identify their difficulties and the sources of their distress."

Technical support was emphasized by inclusive school teachers since it provides feedback to teachers and aids in achieving desired goals (Hassan et al, 2015).

Education of Prospective Teachers

After graduation, there are various programs that give instruction in the field of special education for prospective teachers. Out of these programs some are providing one to two courses regarding inclusive education in there curricula. Regulated teacher education programs, unfortunately, lack any course content that could foster an attitude of acceptance of children with disabilities as full participants in the educational system. As a result, teachers and administrators at regular elementary and secondary schools face a bigger barrier to access (Hameed, A., &Manzoor, F., 2019).

Assessment

Assessment in the classroom is a demanding task, and many students require more assistance. It's tough to compare them using the same criterion. Because there is one curriculum for all learners and the learners have diverseneeds. Assessing all categories of learners in an inclusive setting is extremely challenging and tough task. There should be a separate curriculum and pupils should be examined individually to improve student assessment (Hassan et al, 2015).

Curriculum

Curriculum becomes a major challenge in inclusive education, especially when it comes to contextualizing disabilities with those who have fewer talents. Should pupils with and without impairments have the same or different curriculum? Students having unique instructional needs should receive tailored instruction, so they might understand what they skilled. The current curriculum is inadequate to fulfill the unique needs of all learners and has a number of flaws. In order to create an inclusive classroom, the curriculum must be comprehensive enough to fullfill the needs of all leraners. It is investigated that "curriculum should be varied and flexible so that all pupils can learn" (Hassan et al, 2015).

Table: 2. Themes about the perspectives of inclusive education in Pakistan

Sr. No	Themes	Sub- Themes	Perspectives
1.	Traces of Inclusive Education in Pakistan	The development of new segregated special schools 1990s and early 2001s.	Significant funding support from the Ministry of Special Education.
		Pilot projects	Inclusive Education Project (2015) in two districts of South Punjab, Amin Maktib Model, Rising Sun Model Rural Inclusive Education Project (RIEP), Ghazali Education Trust Lahore
		Legislation	The only noteworthy official document for Persons with Disability in Pakistan is National Policy (2002) which provides a comprehensive framework regarding the schooling of special children by Pakistan government. This policy promotes inclusion but, fundamentally this was based on medical model
2	Inclusive Education in Pakistan: Facts and Practice	Perceptions of Prospective Teachers towards Inclusive Education	Strong spiritual viewpoint to furnish the needs
		Attitudes of Teachers towards Inclusive Education	Positive and willing to teach special need students in Inclusive Education
		Parent Attitudes towards Inclusive Education	Positive parent collaboration, Parents are optimistically involved in their children's good performance in inclusive schools. They seemed satisfied as opposing to previous studies that were carried in regular schools
		Attitudes of Heads	Adequately aware about the purpose of inclusive schooling. The heads were satisfied with the available resources and facilities to run inclusive education program All the heads give their consent in favor of Inclusive Education.
		Attitudes of PWDs	Inclusive education enhances the wellbeing of

		toward Inclusive Education	PWDs and also help them in the improvement of social and emotional development.
3	Impediments	Lack of Awareness	Lack of awareness about accurate meaning, significance, and implementation of inclusive education. Awareness enhancing seminars, workshops and sessions may be conducted to develop awareness about inclusive education.
		Segregated Society	Society ignore PWDs, push person with disabilities in a corner and make them isolated.
		Advocacy of Inclusion	Advocacy can be accepted in diverse manners i.e. through speaking forums and arguments at schools particularly on the subject of inclusion in perspective of Pakistan. Moreover, radio programs can also be broadcasted where teachers and pupils can express their views about this issue.
		Financial barriers	In Pakistan model schools of inclusive education those were studied, suffering from shortage of facilities, services and equipments like ramps, IT gadgets (AV aids, CCTVs, LVDs etc), human resources, resource room.
		Teaching Methodology	schools are not practicing inclusive teaching methodology at present and neglecting the salient feature of inclusive schooling
		Interconnected barriers	lack of confidence, insecurity, transportation, unavailability of teaching support, extended syllabus, shortage of time and facilities, deficiency of trained teaching staff and psychologists.
4	Issues and Challenges	Challenges for PWDs	Negative views toward children with disabilities among parents, teachers, politicians, service providers, and community members, A lack of parental knowledge of the potential of children with impairments, Accessibility of school buildings, schoolrooms, grounds, toilets, and transportation, Disparities in the present curriculum, procedures of assessment, and existing examination system, Insufficient

			financial support, Lack of support system, deficient trained and well qualified professionals, unavailability of medical and paramedical staff, Absence of follow-up and supervision of activities, Unavailability of data regarding the prognosis of disability
5	Strengths of Inclusive Education in Pakistan	Impact on student performance	constructive impact on students' performance and is useful to them
		Ensure Equality	Inclusive education promotes equity and improves societal acceptance of people with disabilities. In an inclusive context, students learn social adjustment
		Impact on Student Personality	Inclusive education fosters a well-balanced personality, a favorable attitude toward school, a healthy sense of self and positive behavior.
		Student involvement	Participation of student is outstanding and they gain knowledge from one another.
		Economical	Inclusionary education is a low-cost strategy that could be applied in Pakistan.
6	Mitigation Spaces to	Policy and legislation	The inclusive education movement was primarily developed and concentrated by national and international NGOs, like UNESCO, UNICEF, and NGOs along the country. There has been no major evolution in policy formation for the inclusive schooling yet. At the moment, both special and regular schools are isolating working
		Social awareness	Awareness in society is really important," a teacher at an inclusive school once said, "and it may be obtained through media or any other means
		Involvement of community	Inclusive schooling encourages society to take an active role in the education of their children

			by supporting the school. In Pakistan, the community is generally not interested in school
		School Ethos	Without the provision of educational opportunities, supports and services to all children, school may be proving a dumping grounds.
		Technical support	Provision of machinery and technical equipment, as well as technical personnel who use the equipment in the inclusive classroom for the benefit of students and learning.
		Curriculum	The current curriculum is inadequate to fulfill the unique needs of all learners and has a number of flaws. Curriculum should be varied and flexible so that all pupils can learn.
		Assessment	Assessing all categories of learners in an inclusive setting is extremely challenging and tough task.

Discussion and conclusion

This literature analysis has provided a summary of researches on inclusive education in Pakistan. This analysis revealed that trend of inclusive education is gaining momentum but at a slow pace. According to the reviewed literature it can be observed that there are few pilot project of inclusive education are working in Pakistan. Pakistan is trying hard to implement and sustain inclusive education in its true spirit. The parents, teachers and students of positive attitude towards inclusive education but there is also plenty of population who is reluctant to accept inclusive education.

Teachers, heads, students and other stakeholders reported several benefits, strengths, issues and challenges regarding inclusive education. According to the literature lack of awareness, segregated society, advocacy of inclusion, financial barriers, teaching methodology, scarce of resources, inaccessible infrastructure are the major and serious barriers in provision of inclusive education.

We highlighted the following issues from our analysis in implementing sustaining inclusive education in Pakistan i.e. for general education teachers it is difficult to address the diverse needs all students in classroom. Moreover, bullying by normal peers to PWDs, development of instructional resources, shortage of resources, time management, communication gap between teachers and students, and classroom management are other challenges that both teachers and students has to face.

The most pleasant aspect that revealed was that majority of prospective teachers, in-service teachers and students were optimistic that inclusive education has enhances their

performance. It gives PWDs equal opportunity to make progress and develop their personality. Inclusive education channels their social and emotional lives.

Pakistan is attempting to raise the rank of inclusive education in country but a lot of work and efforts are required in legislation and policy development, social awareness, community involvement, school ethos, technical support, education and professional development of both prospective and in-service teachers, adequate assessment procedures and a balanced curriculum. These areas are very crucial for the accomplishment of inclusive education in Pakistan.

References

- Ahmad, S., Reba, A., & Ahmad, S. (2020). Comparison between the perceptions of primary school teachers towards inclusive education in Peshawar, Pakistan. *Journal of the Social Sciences*, 48(3).
- C.Praisner."Attitudes of elementary school principals toward the inclusion of students with disabilities", *Exceptional children*, vol.69, pp.135-145.2003.
- D.Fisher,V.Roach and N.Frey." Examining the general programmatic benefits of inclusive schools". *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, vol.6, pp.63-78, 2002.
- Ehsan, M. (2018). Inclusive education in primary and secondary schools of Pakistan: Role of teachers. *American Academic Scientific Research Journal for Engineering, Technology, and Sciences*, 40(1), 40-61.
- Farooq, M. S. (2013). An Inclusive Schooling Model for the Prevention of Dropout in Primary Schools in Pakistan. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, 35(1), 47-74.
- Ghourri, A. M., Abrar, N., & Baloch, A. (2010). Attitude of secondary schools' principles & teachers toward inclusive education: Evidence from Karachi, Pakistan. *European Journal of social sciences*, 15(4), 573-582.
- Hameed, A., &Manzoor, A. (2014). Access to free and compulsory education: A case of children with special needs in the Subcontinent. *Pakistan Journal of Special Education*.15, 287-304.
- Hameed, A., &Manzoor, A. (2019). Similar Agenda, Diverse Strategies: A Review of Inclusive Education Reforms in the Subcontinent. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, 41(2), 53-66.
- Hashmi, S., Khan, I. K., &Khanum, N. (2017). Inclusive education in government primary schools: Teacher perceptions. *Journal of Education and Educational Development*, 4(1).
- HASSAN, U., Hussain, M., Parveen, I., & DE SOUZA, J. (2015). Exploring teachers' experiences and practices in inclusive classrooms of model schools/Model okullarınkaynaştırıcısıniñlarındaöğretmenlerinuygulamalarıvedeneyimlerinininaraştırılması. *EğitimdeKuramveUygulama*, 11(3), 894-915.
- J. Bailey and D.Plessis. "Understanding principals' attitudes towards inclusive schooling. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 35(5), pp.428-438, vol.35, 1997.

- Kazimi, A. B., & Kazmi, S. W. (2018). Developing inclusive education approaches among stakeholders in Pakistan. *Journal of Education and Social Sciences*, 6(1), 86-95.
- Khan, A. M., Sami, A., & Salahuddin, A. (2021). Attitude of Hearing Impaired Students towards Inclusive Education in Pakistan. *Journal of Inclusive Education*, 5(1), 1-14.
- Khan, I. K., & Behlol, M. G. (2014). Inclusive Education at Primary Level: Reality or Phantasm. *Journal of Education and Educational Development*, 1(1), 1-19.
- Malik, G. B. (2011). Inclusive education: Preparation of teachers, challenges in classroom and future prospects. *Pakistan Journal of Education*, 28(2).
- Opertti, R., Walker, Z. and Zhang, Y. (2014) Inclusive Education: From targeting groups and schools to achieving quality education as the core of EFA, In L. Florian (Ed.) *The SAGE Handbook of Special Education* (2nd Revised Edition). London: SAGE.
- Safder, M., Akhtar, M., Fatima, G., & Malik, M. (2012). Problems faced by students with hearing impairment in inclusive education at the university level. *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education*. Vol, 6.
- Shaukat, S., Sharma, U., & Furlonger, B. (2013). Pakistani and Australian Pre-Service Teachers' Attitudes and Self-Efficacy Towards Inclusive Education. *Journal of Behavioural Sciences*, 23(2).
- Tabassum, N., Kiyani, A., Chuadhry, M. A., & Kiyani, S. (2014). Study of attitudes of parents, teachers and managers towards inclusive education in Pakistan. *International Journal of Innovation and Applied Studies*, 9(3), 1128.
- ul Hassan, M. U., Parveen, I., & Un-Nisa, R. (2010). Exploring teachers' perspectives: Qualms and possibilities for inclusive classes in Pakistan. *The Journal of the International Association of Special Education*, 56.
- UNICEF. (2014). *Global initiative on out of school children*. South Asia Regional Study.