
Identification of Vocational Well-being Taxonomy For TVET Sustainable Growth: An initial review

REGINA LAMBIN^{A*}, RAMLEE MUSTAPHA^B, MP ROSLIN MD SHARIF^C

^{ab}Sultan Idris Education University, Malaysia

^cWollywood Production Sdn Bhd, Malaysia

Email:geenalambin@gmail.com

ABSTRACT:The Industrial Revolution 4.0 (IR4.0) era has changed the working environments and the expertise of many professions rapidly. This 21st Century is a daunting period for all the workforce because it requires a new technical and soft skills suite. Thus, this study aims to identify the Vocational Wellbeing Taxonomy (VWT) for sustainable growth of Technical Vocational and Education Training (TVET). TVET has a significant role in achieving and supporting sustainable growth. Its institutions are the primary supplier of the workforce that will be at the forefront in dealing directly with sustainability issues. As the rates of fresh-grade unemployment increase, students are more mindful of engaging in the vocational stream to ensure the workplace's well-being. Bloom's taxonomy has been used in an educational context to identify educational goals, objectives, and outcomes since 1956. However, it does not fulfil the 'well-being' assessment criterion for highly skilled workers with technical expertise. The concepts of well-being are closely linked to human capital that could be translated into individual skills, as highlighted in TVET. Therefore, the identification of VWT is crucial to provide a framework for the determination of objectives and evaluating learning outcomes relevant to vocational education. In this study, the VWT domains are expecting to contribute to the worker's well-being for the sustainable growth of TVET. This initial study employed a thorough review of the relevant literature.

Keywords: Vocational Well-being Taxonomy, Bloom Taxonomy, TVET, sustainable growth, workers' well-being

INTRODUCTION

Technical Vocational and Education Training (TVET) is one of the country's main agendas so that people are highly skilled, and they can drive the economy and well-being of the people. It shows that TVET plays a vital role in producing high-skilled workers (Hanapi, Nordin & Rus, 2014). TVET is also a highlight as one of the strategies in achieving Shared Prosperity Vision 2030. The purpose of Shared Prosperity Vision 2030 is for Malaysia to make life quality as a developed nation focused on the well-being of the people through various innovation strategies and transformation. Well-being is a positive outcome that is important for individuals and numerous sectors of society since it tells us that individuals see that their lives are going well. The term well-being is closely related to health and quality of life. According to Sfeatcu et al. (2014), it is a concept used to portray a person or a group's condition concerning social, economic, psychological, spiritual, or medical attention. Well-being also refers to the physical, emotional, mental, and cultural comforts that can be achieved when the needs are met. It also linked to human capital, which can be translated into individual skills, as highlighted in TVET.

Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) comprises education and training and skills development relating to a wide range of occupational fields. Ramlee (2017) stated that TVET is a field of education and training based on formal or informal skills. It is an educational institution that targets to produce students who have the knowledge and diverse skills base for improving the quality to become skilled workers when venturing into the working world (Lauglo & Lillis, 1988; Jailani et al., 2017). It is universally known for its duty in grooming people for changing aspects commitment in careers of operational worth, the productive basis of a competent workforce, and planning to get ready its beneficiaries with the proper skills and values required to be employable in the world of work (Oviawe, 2018; Oviawe & Ehirheme, 2019). However, Malaysia still critically lags in terms of the number of skilled workers, accounting for only 24.0 per cent (1,976 thousand) from the overall workers in 2017, estimated at 9,617 thousand persons (Department Statistics of Malaysia, 2018).

Among the factors leading to this unemployment is poor human capital skills and do not meet job market standards. Human development skills such as interpersonal skills, problem-solving, self-esteem, leadership, and

others are unsatisfactory (Department of Skills Development, 2017). In the 21st Century, employability and unemployment continue to be urgent issues that graduates faced daily in the employment market, which require them to have value-added to compete in the job market (Dawi et al., 2019). According to Rasul, Husain, and Rauf (2014), employers want skilled workers in various fields, including workability and technical skills. Besides, the main problem with the education system in Malaysia is that it focuses too much on the academic stream, so that the vocational stream is considered second class. According to Dawi et al. (2019), most of the programs that students were attended in the university are focused on academics. As the rate of unemployment among the academic stream begins to rise, there is awareness to enhance students' participation in the vocational stream to ensure their well-being in terms of getting a job. Therefore, people's well-being through "full-employment" may not be achieved if the strategy boosts skilled employees through TVET not being rounded.

Bloom's taxonomy has been created in academic education to classify educational goals, objectives, and outcomes. It is also often used in the design of test questions for the curriculum or syllabus. The main idea of taxonomy in education is to classify educational objectives sequentially; the primary level must be mastered before the next level (Huitt, 2011; Norhazizi, 2019). Nevertheless, Bloom's Taxonomy does not meet the criteria for assessing "well-being" through vocational skills to get a job in highly-skilled fields. Several issues are highlighted in the development of TVET in this country, emphasizing academic flow and lack of focus on high vocational skills. In TVET, Bloom's Taxonomy does not explicitly address essential aspects of TVET, such as motor skills, visualization, innovation, creativity, and inventiveness. According to Norhazizi (2019), among the issues of concern to the researcher are Bloom's Taxonomy's weaknesses in classifying competencies in the vocational field and its lack of emphasis on the psychomotor domain, which is the main field of vocational education. A study conducted by Norhazizi (2019) stated that vocational subjects stress psychomotor domains, while academic disciplines emphasize cognitive domains, but both domains remain affective domains.

Although the concept of objectives and teaching outcomes in Bloom's Taxonomy emphasizes the cognitive domain, other educational psychologists have also proposed ways to set teaching objectives in the affective and psychomotor domains to assist teachers in the design and implementation of teaching purposes in the three main fields: cognitive, affective and psychomotor (Ebel & Frisbie, 1991). Based on some of Bloom's taxonomy disadvantages, several related taxonomies have been developing by some researchers (Carbonell, 2004). However, the group failed to develop the psychomotor domain that Simpson later expanded in 1967 with Harrow in 1972 (Winkel, 1987; Norhazizi, 2019). This is because the vocational field promotes acquiring the skills, knowledge, and attitudes necessary for a professional career (UNESCO, 2011). As emphasized by Rus et al., 2015, vocational training in Malaysia emphasized individual skills via experiential learning. The development of physical or practical skills is one of the most critical aspects of vocational education. It is an orientation towards the workplace and emphasizes the curriculum and skills, and innovation, so the psychomotor field is the most emphasized in vocational education (Okwelle, 2013). Consequently, there is a gap in the shaping of learning objectives and outcomes in the psychomotor field, so the development of Vocational WellBeing Taxonomy (VWT) is critical.

In this study, VWT focuses more on the psychomotor domain. To develop VWT, a brief description of the historical context of philosophical differences and the purpose of academic and vocational education is needed. To date, there are no comprehensive classifications for vocational fields built to look at the index of people's well-being through mastery of vocational skills. Hence, a VWT is critical to developing the quality of human capital efficiency for its well-being in the long term. The relationship between TVET and individual well-being should be studied empirically. Based on observations, studies, and literature, important domains in TVET, such as motor intelligence, visualization, innovation, creativity, and invention, need to be confirmed in the form of critical VWT developed. Therefore, this study's objective was to identify the VWT domains that could enhance skilled workers' well-being for TVET sustainable growth.

Bloom Taxonomy

Taxonomy is a practice and classification of science for certain things or concepts, including primary classification principles. Smith (2002) and Saidani et al. (2019) stated that Taxonomy is related to an empirical classification scheme suitable for descriptive analysis. The taxonomy classification is the primary method used to assess an organism's groups (Purcell, 2018; Komarek et al., 2014; Norhazizi, 2019). The concepts and principles need to be followed in the taxonomy to strengthen taxonomy development, especially in education. In the field of education, Norhazizi (2019) emphasized that taxonomy aims at classifying knowledge and thinking needed in various areas of education and customarily used to analyze the education field. Education taxonomy mainly focuses on preparing the classification in the education system.

However, most teaching models emphasize the cognitive domain and not the affective and psychomotor domains (Sperber, 2005). All these three domains are important to understand students (Anderson & Sosniak, 1994; Anderson & Krathwohl, 2001; Marzano & Kendall, 2007; Toni, 2012) and inseparable (Anderson & Krathwohl, 2001; Toni, 2012). This classification is student-centred and oriented on behaviours that involved two main domains in classifying the learning objectives: cognitive domain and affective domain, and then

developed to the psychomotor domain. According to Okwelle (2013), the psychomotor domain is important in vocational education, especially with physical skills or practical development. In vocational education, the orientation towards the outside world of the working environment and the emphasis on the curriculum in skills are crucial criteria (Norhazizi, 2019).

Vocational education

Vocational education prepares students for the work field (Pavlova, 2008; Ramlee, 2017). It complements making individuals become workers for various careers and preparing them further in the next education level. Therefore, education and vocational training are an education in developing skills, competencies, understanding, behaviours, attitudes, work practices, and appreciation of jobs needed by the world (Norhazizi, 2019). The objective of vocational education is to produce students who are exposed to the field of vocational education at the upper secondary level (Ramlee, 2017) and to prepare vocational students with the expertise in technics or technology that related to jobs, including other job competencies (Haolader et al., 2015).

Meanwhile, Labaree (1997) stated that vocational education aims to safeguard the importance of the economy for a certain country that wants to be advanced must continuously prepare the workforce to develop the economic sector. In other words, the main objective of forming vocational schools is to develop a school curriculum that is responsive to workforce needs in the labour market, especially for skilled and semi-skilled areas (Nohazizi, 2019). Therefore, the development of curriculum in the vocational field should refer to vocational education's objective. As emphasized by Norhazizi (2019), the curriculum of vocational education is a curriculum that focuses on hands-on activities that are hands-on and equipped with the latest skills in vocational. It is the main focus on students' performance in mastering their skills related to the jobs.

Well-being

Wellness can be seen from various angles of life. The most important aspect is related to the standard of living of the population. Several attempts have been made to define well-being, although none of the definitions has altogether detained the essence of well-being. According to McCallum and Price (2015), well-being is characterized as more than just the absence of illness and includes life satisfaction, healthy behaviours, and resilience. It is more to the value of happiness and life satisfaction of an individual, including having good mental health, high life satisfaction, a sense of meaning or purpose, and the ability to manage stress. Well-being is needed to aspire to succeed and live long happy, and productive lives. (McCallum & Price, 2016). Shah and Marks (2004) stated that;

Well-being is more than just happiness. As well as feeling satisfied and happy, well-being means developing as a person, being fulfilled, and making a contribution to the community (Shah & Marks, 2004, p. 2)".

Generally, well-being is a multidimensional construct. There are five significant types of well-being; i) social well-being, ii) workplace well-being, iii) emotional well-being, iv) physical well-being, and v) societal well-being. To build overall well-being, all of these types must be functioning to an extent. Failure to address well-being at work would result in an organization losing on managing human capital welfare at a workplace because it is crucial for increasing productivity and workforce performance (Sabran & Abd Karim, 2020).

People's well-being is very much related to the progress of a country. As Yusoff and Yusoff (2009) emphasized, the population's well-being or quality of life is important either from its economic, social, and political perspectives. From an economic perspective, people who have the well-being of their lives could contribute more productively to the country's economy through education, training, and population health. While in terms of social and political perspectives, the well-being of the people leads to a higher standard of living, unity, harmony, and can guarantee political stability in the long term.

CONCLUSION

The 21st-century educational sector faces the challenge of preparing competitive students. Thus, TVET plays an essential role in producing high-skilled human capital and enhancing energy competitiveness in social work and can create the local workforce needed by the industry and the country. Vocational education principles are based on pragmatism philosophy, which will balance essentialist philosophy and allow new ideas to be considered in practical works. Literature has illustrated that taxonomy is developed to focus on students' knowledge and skills to fulfil the course's needs but from different perspectives. The only difference supported by the study is the difference between declarative/conceptual knowledge (remember, comprehension or understanding) and procedural knowledge (application or task execution). Due to this, a thorough study that involves theory and model in vocational and educational taxonomy is needed to produce relevant domains.

The characteristics or domain of vocational skills are classifications in vocational qualifications to facilitate profiling or mapping vocational skills that can contribute to workers' well-being and sustainability beyond the country. The psychological, social, and economic sustainability factors are also crucial as well-being indicators (Howarth, 2012). These three aspects (psychological, social, and economic) are chosen because they are often used to index well-being. In psychology, the index of well-being includes self-confidence, motivation,

satisfaction, and self-actualization. In social, the index of well-being is communication skills, supportive skills, and network building. Meanwhile, the important economic indices in this study are income, GDP, and productivity. Therefore, a VWT is critical to improving the quality of human capital efficiency for long-term national well-being.

REFERENCES

1. Anderson, L.W., & Sosniak, L. A. (Eds.). (1994). Bloom's taxonomy: A forty-year retrospective. Ninety-third yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education, Pt.2.Chicago, IL. University of Chicago Press.
2. Anderson, L. W., & Krathwohl, D. R. (Eds.). (2001). A taxonomy for learning, teaching and assessing: A revision of Bloom's taxonomy of educational objectives: New York: Longman.
3. Carbonell, L. (2004). Instructional development timeline: Learning theory. Retrieved from <http://www.educationau.edu.au/archives/cp/>.
4. Dawi, A. H., Idris, I., Lambin, R., & Ibrahim, A. B. (2019). Preliminary Study on the Implementation of National Human Development Coaching in Malaysian Skills Diploma. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 9(9), 798–810.
5. Department of Skills Development (2017). National Occupational Skills Standard (NOSS), National Human Development Coaching. Retrieved on 8th April 2020 from: <https://www.dsd.gov.my/>
6. Department of Statistics of Malaysia, 2018. Employment and Salaries & Wages Statistics 2018. Retrieved on 8th April 2020 from: <https://www.dosm.gov.my>
7. Diener, E., Lucas, R. E., & Oishi, S. (2002). Subjective well-being: The science of happiness and life satisfaction. *Handbook of positive psychology*, 2, 63-73.
8. Ebel, R. L., & Frisbie, D. A. (1991). *Essentials of educational measurement*. (5th ed.). Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall Inc.
9. Hanapi, Z., Nordin, M. S., & Rus, R. C. (2014). Unemployment problem among graduates of technical field: Competencies of the graduates and quality of the education. *Sains Humanika*, 2(2).
10. Haolader, F. A., Ali, M. R., & Foyso, K. M. (2015). The taxonomy for learning, teaching, and assessing: Current practices at polytechnics in Bangladesh and its effects on developing students' competences. *International Journal for Research in Vocational Education and Training(IJRVT)* Vol. 2, No. 2: 99-118.
11. Huit, W. (2011). Bloom et al. 's taxonomy of the cognitive domain. *Educational Psychology Interactive*. Valdosta, GA: Valdosta State University. Retrieved from <http://www.edpsycinteractive.orang/topics/cogsys/bloom.html> [pdf].
12. Howarth, R. B. (2012). Sustainability, well-being, and economic growth. *Minding Nature*, 5(2), 32-39.
13. Hole, Y., & Snehal, P. (2019). Challenges and solutions to the development of the tourism and hospitality industry in India. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*. 8 (3), 1-11
14. Hole, Y., & Snehal, P. & Bhaskar, M. (2018). Service marketing and quality strategies. *Periodicals of engineering and natural sciences*,6 (1), 182-196.
15. Hole, Y., & Snehal, P. (2019). The significance of pilgrimage tourism to sustainable development with special reference to the Indian context. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*. 8 (3), 1-11
16. Jailani, M. Y., Siti, N. K. R., Faizal, A. N. Y., Maizam, A., Syahril, S., Marina, I. M., ... & Junita, S. (2017). Vocational pedagogy among technical vocational education and training teachers. In 2017 IEEE International Conference on Industrial Engineering and Engineering Management (IEEM), pp. 150-154.
17. Komarek, J., Kastovsky, J., Mares, J., and Johansen, J. R. (2014). Taxonomic classification of cyanoprokaryotes (cyanobacterial genera), using a polyphasic approach. *Preslia* 86, 295–335.
18. Labaree, D. P. (1997). Public goods, private goods: The American struggle over educational goals. *American Educational Research Journal*, 34 (1), 39-81.
19. Lauglo, J. and Lillis, K. (1988). *Vocationalizing Education an International Perspective*. London: Pergamons Books Ltd, 1988.
20. Marzano, R., & Kendall, J. (2007). *The new taxonomy of educational objectives* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press.
21. McCallum, F., & Price, D. (2015). *Well-being in education*.
22. Norhazizi, L.B., (2019). *Pembangunan Taksonomi Vokasional Berdasarkan Teknik Delphi*. (Doctoral dissertation, Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris).
23. Okwelle P. C. (2013). Appraisal of theoretical models of psychomotor skills and applications to technical vocational education and training (tv) system in Nigeria. *Journal of Research and Development*, 1, (6), 25-35.
24. Oviawe, J. I. (2018). Revamping technical, vocational education and training through public-private partnerships for skill development. *Makerere Journal of Higher Education*, 10(1), 1-19.

25. Oviawe, J. I., & Ehirheme, P. E. (2019). Sprouting Sustainable Industrial and Technological Workforce through Technical Vocational Education and Training in South-South, Nigeria. *Journal of Vocational Education Studies*, 2(2), 113-126. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.12928/joves.v2i2.1192>.
26. Pavlova, M. (2008). *Technology and vocational education for sustainable development: Empowering individuals for the future* (Vol. 10). Springer Science & Business Media.
27. Purcell, A. (2018). *Basic Biology: An introduction*. Basic Biology Limited. New Zealand ISBN Agency, National Library of New Zealand.
28. Ramlee Mustapha. (2017). *Skills Training and Vocational Education in Malaysia*. In: Samuel M., Tee M., Symaco L. (eds) *Education in Malaysia. Education in the Asia-Pacific Region: Issues, Concerns, and Prospects*, vol 39. Springer, Singapore
29. Rasul, M. S., Husain, M. Y., & Rauf, R. A. A. (2014). *Kemahiran kebolehdapatan kerja: suatu keperluan pekerjaan*. Penerbit Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia.
30. Rus, R. C., Yasin, R. M., Yunus, F. A. N., Rahim, M. B., & Ismail, I. M. (2015). Skilling for job: A grounded theory of vocational training at industrial training institutes of Malaysia. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 204, 198-205.
31. Sabran, R., & Abd Karim, N. K. (2020, March). *Managing Pressuring Eco-System Influencing Media Workers' Well-Being in Malaysian Creative Industries*. In the 2nd Social and Humaniora Research Symposium (SoRes 2019) (pp. 617-621). Atlantis Press.
32. Saidani, M., Yannou, B., Leroy, Y., Cluzel, F., & Kendall, A. (2019). A taxonomy of circular economy indicators. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 207, 542-559.
33. Sfeatcu, R., Cernușcă-Mițariu, M., Ionescu, C., Roman, M., Cernușcă-Mițariu, S., Coldea, L., & Burcea, C. C. (2014). The concept of wellbeing in relation to health and quality of life. *European Journal of Science and Theology*, 10(4), 123-128.
34. Shah, H., & Marks, N. (2004). *A well-being manifesto for a flourishing society*. London: The New Economics Foundation
35. Smith, K.B. 2002. Typologies, taxonomies, and the benefits of policy classification. *Policy Studies Journal*, Sep. 2002.
36. Sperber, M. (2005). 'How undergraduate education became college lite and a personal apology.' In Thomas C. Reeves. (2006). *How do you know they are learning?: The importance of alignment in higher education*. *Int. J. Learning Technology*, 2(4), 294-309.
37. Toni. G. (2012). *A quantitative content analysis of the common core state standards compared to Missouri's grade-level expectations using the revised Bloom's Taxonomy framework*. Unpublished Doctoral dissertation, Education Faculty of Lindenwood University.
38. UNESCO. (2011). *Technical and Vocational Education and Training*. <http://www.unesco.org/new/en/education/themes/education-building-bl>. Retrieved on 10/7/2015.
39. Winkel, F. W. (1987). *Politie en voorkoming misdrijven: Effecten en neveneffecten van voorlichting* (Doctoral dissertation, Mens en Recht).
40. Yussof, I. & Yusoff, M. (2009). *Pertumbuhan Ekonomi dan Kualiti Hidup Penduduk: ekonomi malaysia ke arah pembangunan seimbang*. (61-75). UKM Bangi.